1

TERMS & CONCEPTS -I

Unit Structure

1.0 OBJECTIVES

- To introduce the readers to two types of translation viz: Formal and Dynamic.

- To acquaint the readers with inter and intra-lingual translations.

- To understand the vital role that a translator plays in the process of translation.

- To help the learners understand the strategies the translator uses.

- To know the qualities and qualifications that the translator ideally should possess.

1.1 INTRODUCTION

Correspondence and equivalence are frequently used in translation studies. **Correspondence** indicates the similarities of the symbols and structures of the two languages in use in translation. Though there can be no absolute correspondence between two languages, a translation may be close to the original if it is done scientifically and systematically. Equivalence indicates the comparable and similar elements found in two languages. Equivalences are classified into many categories by different theorists. Eugene Nida in *Towards a Science of Translation* classifies equivalence into **Formal Equivalence** and **Dynamic Equivalence**. As far as the types of translation are concerned, traditional translation theorists divided translation into two types, namely Literary and non-Literary translation. Literary translation emphasised both "sense and style" while non-literary translation emphasised the sense alone. Taking a linguistic stance Roman Jacobson makes a threefold classification of translation as Inter-lingual, intra-lingual and inter-semiotic translation.

1.2 FORMAL AND DYNAMIC EQUIVALENCE

Formal Equivalence and Dynamic Equivalence are two approaches to Translation. Dynamic Equivalence attempts to render the text word-for-word at the expense of natural expressions in the target language. Formal Equivalence, which is also known as Functional Equivalence, tries to convey the idea expressed in the source text at the expense of literalness, original word order and the source text's grammatical voice. Formal Equivalence emphasizes literal fidelity to the source text whereas Dynamic Equivalence emphasizes readability.

1.2.1 Formal Equivalence

The focus in Formal Equivalence is on the message of the source language text (SLT) in both form and context. If Formal Equivalence is taken as the guiding principle, then the translator has to be concerned with formal correspondences such as poetry to poetry and sentence to sentence. In such an orientation in translation, the message in the target language should match the different elements in the source language. Hence, Formal Equivalence demands accuracy and correctness. This type of translation based on structural equivalence is also called a **gloss translation**. This indicates that the translator attempts to reproduce as literally and meaningfully as possible the form and content of the original. A translation based on Formal Equivalence offers a close correspondence to the structure of the Source language Text (SLT). Such a gloss translation enables the reader to identify himself/herself with the source language context and its means of expression. For example, a phrase like "holy kiss" would be rendered literally and supplemented with a footnote explaining that this was a customary method of greeting found in the New Testament.

1.2.1.1. Principles Governing Formal Equivalence

Formal Equivalence is basically source-oriented and it tries to reveal the form and content of the source language text. A Formal Equivalence Translation (FET) attempts to reproduce several formal elements in translation such as

1. Grammatical units

2. Consistency in word usage

3. Meaning in terms of source context.

For instance, the reproduction of grammatical units in translation may consist of:

A] Translating nouns by nouns, verbs by verbs.

B] Keeping all phrases and sentences intact (not splitting them up or readjusting the grammatical units)

C] Preserving all forms of indicators (marks of punctuation, markers of cohesion and paragraph breaks)

Another principle closely observed in formal equivalence is a concordance of terminology, that is, it always renders a particular term in its source language meaning. For instance, if one translates Aristotle's *Poetics* into Hindi or Marathi, there must be a rigid consistency in the rendering of key terms like *catharsis*, *hubris* and *mimesis* in the way in which Aristotle has used them. However, in many instances, a translator cannot reproduce the normal structure of the source message. For example, puns, instances of assonance and idioms defy formal equivalent rendering. In such cases, a translator can use marginal notes. A good Formal Equivalence Translation is supplemented with marginal notes. These notes not only explain some formal features but also the equivalents employed in the translation.

1.2.2. Dynamic Equivalence

Dynamic Equivalence is based on the principle of equivalent effect. In such a translation, one is not concerned with matching the receptor language message with the source language message, but with a dynamic relationship i.e., the relationship between receptor and message should be the same as that which existed between the original receptors and the source language text. It also tries to achieve complete naturalness of expression. It attempts to relate the receptor to the modes of behavior relevant to the context of his culture. In this mode, the translator does not insist on understanding the cultural patterns of the source language context to understand the message. A good example of dynamic equivalence translation is J. B. Philips's rendering of the New Testament. In this translation, he interprets the message "Greet one another with a holy kiss" as "give one another a hearty handshake".

1.2.2.1. Principles Governing Dynamic Equivalence

Dynamic Equivalence Translation (DET) can be described as one concerning both bilingual and bicultural aspects of translation. It is a translation that reflects both the meaning and the intention of source language test.

As Dynamic Equivalence Translation is directed toward the equivalence of response rather than the equivalence of form, it is also called **natural equivalence**. Generally, Dynamic Equivalence Translation fits into three areas of the communication process:

1] The receptor language and culture as a whole

2] The context of the particular message, and

3] The receptor language audience

Though Dynamic Equivalence Translation is the most natural form of translation, it involves two principal areas of adaptation, namely,

A] Grammar

B] Lexical

In general, grammatical modifications can be readily made since they are dictated by the available structures of the receptor language. Similarly, the lexical structures of the source message are also adjusted to the requirements of the receptor language. There are three lexical levels to be considered in Dynamic Equivalence:

1] Terms for which there are readily available parallels (for instance a river, stone, house, etc)

2] Terms that identify culturally different objects but with somewhat similar functions. (For instance, the word "book" which in English means an object with paper bound together and in the New Testament time it meant a papyrus rolled up in the form of a scroll.)

3] Term which identifies cultural specificities (for instance synagogue, temple, mosque, saree etc.)

The first set of terms involves no problem in Translation. In the case of the second set of terms that have similar functions, one must use another term which reflects the form of the original term, though not the equivalent function of the term. In translating the term of the third set, cultural associations cannot be avoided. For instance, a term like "baptism," 'anointing" or "confession" cannot be translated easily into Indian languages while maintaining their cultural significance.

Though Dynamic Equivalence Translation is based on the receptor language and culture, its problems are not restricted to only grammatical and lexical features. Some detailed matters such as intonation, rhythm and anachronism can create additional problems in Dynamics Equivalence Translation.

A translation that aims at dynamic equivalence also involves some amount of formal adjustments. For instance, in translating poetry, more adjustments in the form would be required than in the translation of prose. A translation of Dynamic Equivalence confronts some serious restrictions at the linguistic and cultural levels. The linguistic restrictions involve both the literary form and the language used in the message. The cultural restriction involves the attitude about the so-called faithfulness in translating. There are certain areas of tension between Formal Equivalence and Dynamic Equivalence as they represent two extreme practices in translation. These tensions can be listed as:

1] There may be no object or event in the receptor culture which corresponds to some referent in the source text, or the equivalent function could be served by another object or event. For instance, *pooja* in Indian culture may be a functional equivalent in the form of prayer in English. Yet they are two different referents altogether.

2] The receptor culture does possess the same object or event as it is mentioned in the source message, but in the receptor language, it may

have an entirely different function. For instance, a candle in the western tradition is associated with prayer but in the Indian cultural context, it is only a means of light.

3] There is no equivalent either formal or functional. For instance, in the translation of a sonnet into Indian languages, one doesn't find a formal equivalence of the poem in the receptor language/culture nor does one find any functional equivalence.

1.3 INTRA-LINGUAL TRANSLATION AND INTER-LINGUAL TRANSLATION

In *'On Linguistic Aspects of Translation*, the Russian-born American structuralist **Roman Jakobson** describes three kinds of translation as follows:

i.   Intra-lingual translation, or rewording (an interpretation of words in the same language)
ii. Interlingual translation or translation proper. (An interpretation of verbal signs employing some other language).
iii. Inter semiotic translation or transmutation (an interpretation of verbal signs through non-verbal sign systems.)

1.3.1. Intra-lingual translation:

Intra-lingual translation or rewording is an interpretation of verbal signs utilizing other signs of the same language.

This sort of translation is confined to the same language. Paraphrasing of a play can be rewritten using similar or synonymous words. The Intra-lingual translation of a word uses either another more or less word or resorts to a circumlocution. Yet synonymy, as a rule, is not complete equivalence for example "every celibate is a bachelor, but not every bachelor is a celibate" A word or an idiomatic phrase word, briefly a code unit of the highest level may be fully interpreted only through an equivalent combination of code units i.e. a message referring to this code unit: "every bachelor is an unmarried man, and every unmarried man is a bachelor" or "every celibate is bound not to marry and everyone who is bound not to marry is celibate."

Translation occurs when we rephrase an expression in the same language. In the following example, *revenue nearly tripled* is a kind of intralingual translation of the first part of the sentence, a fact that is highlighted by the trigger expression *in other words*.

In the decade before 1989 revenue averaged around [NZ] $1 billion a year while in the decade after it averaged nearly [NZ] $3 billion a year – in other words, revenue nearly tripled. Intralingual translation, however, is outside the scope of proper translation study.

1.3.2. Interlingual translation:

Interlingual translation or translation proper is an interpretation of verbal signs by means of some other language in which a text of the SL is turned into a new text in the TL. In translation studies, inter-lingual translation is discussed highlighting its methods and theories.

According to Bertrand Russell, "No one can understand the word 'cheese' unless he has non-linguistic acquaintance with cheese. If, however, we follow Russell's fundamental precept and place our "emphasis upon the linguistic aspects of the traditional philosophical problem", then we are obliged to that no one understands the word "cheese" unless he has an acquaintance with the meaning that is assigned to this word in the lexical code of English. Any representative of a cheese-less culture will understand the English word "cheese" he is aware that in this language it means "food made of pressed curds" and if he has at least a linguistic acquaintance with "curd" We never consumed ambrosia or nectar and have only a linguistic acquaintance with the words "ambrosia", and "gods" - the name of their mythical users; nonetheless, we understand these words and know in what contexts each of them may be used.

The meaning of the words "cheese", "apple", "nectar", "acquaintance", "but", "mere" and of word or phrase is to be mere precise and less - a semist fact Against those who assign (signature) not the sign but to the thing itself the simple truest argument would be that nobody has even smelled or tasted the meaning of "cheese" or "apple" There is no signatum without signum. The meaning of the word "cheese" cannot be inferred from a non-linguistic acquaintance with cheddar or with camembert without the assister of the verbal code. An array of linguistic signs is needed to introduce a word. Mere pointing will not teach us whether "cheese" is the name of the given specimen, or of any box camembert or sumembert in general, or any cheese, any milk product any food, any refreshment or perhaps any box irrespective of contents. Finally, does a word simply name the thing in question or does it imply a meaning such as offering sale, prohibition, or malediction?

For linguists and ordinary word-users, the meaning of any linguistic sign is its transaction into some further alternative sign, especially a sign "in which it is more fully developed" as price, the deepest inquirer into the essence of signs insistently stated. The term "bachelor" may be converted into a more explicit designation, "Unmarried man" whenever higher explicitness is required. We distinguished three ways of interpreting verbal signs which may be translated into other signs of the same language into another language, or into another system of symbols. These three kinds of translation are to be differently labeled.

Most frequently, however, translation from one language into another, substitutes messages in one language not for separate code-units but for entire message in some other language. Such translation in a reported speech, the translator records and transmits a message received from

another source. Thus, translation involves two equivalent messages in two different codes.

It is the **interlingual translation,** between two different verbal sign systems, that has been the traditional focus of translation studies. The question of what we mean by 'translation', and how it differs from 'adaptation', 'version', 'transcreation' 'localization' and so on, is a very real one. Much of translation theory has also been written from a western perspective and initially derived from the study of Classical Greek and Latin and Biblical practice. For instance, in India there is the Bengali *rupantar* (= 'change of form') and the Hindi *anuvad* (= 'speaking after', 'following'), in the Arab world *tarjama* (= 'biography') and in China *fan yi* (= 'turning over').Each of these construes the process of translation differently and anticipates that the target text will show a substantial change of form compared to the source.

1.4 QUALITIES AND STRATEGIES OF TRANSLATOR

A good translator is not born but made. With a little care and some labour, a person can acquire the skills of a good translator. Some of the qualities that distinguish a good and successful translator from a bad or unsuccessful translator are mentioned below.

Faithfulness to the Original Text and the Author: A competent translator should try to get into the mind of the writer of the original text in the source language. S/He should also fully understand the sense and meaning of the original author. S/He should try to put in every effort to ensure that the translation resembles the original text or is very close to the original text in terms of its sense and message. Expert and experienced translators know the requirements of a text and make changes to communicate the style and essence of a text with minimal variations from the original. While trying to be faithful to the original text, s/he should not try to find difficult equivalent words in the hope that this will add to the perfection of your translation. A faithful translator should act like the author's **mouthpiece** in a way that he knows and comprehends fully whatever the original author has said in his text. The translation should have all the ease of the original composition.

Technical Expertise: The translator has to be an analytical person with the necessary flexibility, adaptability and expertise in the use of technology so that s/he can pay close attention to all details and adapt whenever there is a need. Moreover, s/he should have a thorough knowledge of the subject that s/he deals with. A person translating the biography of a great personality should have thorough knowledge of the life and achievements of the person concerned. A translator should be an excellent writer with good research and language skills so that s/he can find out things that s/he requires and make use of them in appropriate places. Writing skills help a translator make intelligent choices concerning words, structures and expressions. The translator should use forms of speech and expressions in common use so that the audience can

comprehend them properly. Finally, s/he should choose and order words appropriately to produce the correct tone and convey the desired meaning.

Using the Right Tools: Experienced translators know how to use the tools like good monolingual and bilingual dictionaries, encyclopaedias, e-dictionaries, glossaries of technical and standard works, etc. about the SL text and style guides to help him/her out in moments of difficulty. One should start using them from the beginning so that in course of time it becomes easy to find out the equivalent terms without wasting much time and energy on them. Having dictionaries on the computer can also save a lot of time and labor.

Focus on Creativity: Expert translators are always creative. They always try to put the text in the target language in a new and attractive garb to make it more acceptable to the audience in the target language. They do this by using a new vocabulary, new expressions and structures whenever necessary to make the translated text more appealing to the audience. It is because of the creative component and the amount of liberty involved in an act of translation, a translator finds his/her job very rewarding and intellectually stimulating.

Focus on Reading as an Important Pre-requisite: A serious translator should read a lot to have an in-depth understanding of the **nuances** of the languages s/he deals with (both the source language and the target language). This habit is essential to help a translator gain command of the language. In the list of reading materials, one may put the classics, newspapers and digital material available online on the internet.

Linguistic Competence: A seasoned translator should be well-conversant with the grammatical, syntactic, semantic and **pragmatic features** as well as the socio-cultural contexts of both the source language and the target language. S/He may have the liberty to interpret an idea differently but in no case should try to insert his/her ideas or personal impressions in the new product. Moreover, s/he should take care that the style chosen for translation is appropriate for the target audience and should sound natural and spontaneous to the readers of the translated text.

Specialization: A mature translator should have sound knowledge of the discipline to which the target text belongs, particularly the materials which have a highly technical vocabulary. You should be familiar with the new terminology and the latest developments in the discipline in which you are working. If one has expertise in translating literary texts, s/he will have difficulty in translating medical or business reports or technical reports.

Giving a Finishing Touch: In an act of translation, you should have enough patience and have to do the job sincerely. You may also like to discuss your problem areas with the persons you think are competent to address the problems. Before preparing the final product, you should go through the translated work two or three times and see if any last-minute changes can be made to make it look more accessible and acceptable. You may like to change a few words, expressions or forms to improve the quality. Before letting the work out for publication, you should ensure that

the product is suitable for the intended purpose and audience. You may have to change the style or language following the audience and purpose. Once you are satisfied with the work, you should put the original passage aside and listen to/read your translation with the ears tuned in, as if it were a passage originally written in the target language. You may also ask a friend of yours or an expert in the target language to listen to the translation and give suggestions for improvement. After incorporating the changes suggested, submit it to the agency or the organization that had assigned you the job.

1.5 CONCLUSION

Eugene Nida and Roman Jacobson have contributed substantially to the field of translation studies. The two types of equivalence given by Nida viz: Formal and dynamic are very important for non-literary and literary translation respectively. Intra-lingual and inter-lingual translations categorized by Jacobson are significant in understanding the translation proper. The role, qualities, and responsibilities of a translator and the strategies s/he uses while translating especially a literary text need an attention of a student while studying translation theories.

1.6 CHECK YOUR PROGRESS

Write Short notes on:

1. Principles governing Formal Equivalence and Dynamic Equivalence.

2. Features of Dynamics Equivalence Translation.

3. Limitations of Formal Equivalence Translation

4. Intra- and inter-lingual translation

5. Qualities of a good translator

6. Qualifications of a good translator

7. Responsibilities of a good translator

❖❖❖❖

2

TERMS & CONCEPTS - II

Unit Structure

2.0   Objectives of the Unit

2.1   Introduction

2.2   Lexicography and Bilingual Dictionaries

2.3   Commercial and Collaborative Translation

2.4   Audio Visual, Subtitling and Dubbing

2.5   Conclusion

2.6   Check Your Progress

2.7   Bibliography

2.0 OBJECTIVES

- To introduce the learners to the concept of lexicography

- To introduce the learners to the concept of bilingual dictionaries

- To orient the learners to the concept of commercial translation

- To orient the learners to the concept of collaborative translation

- To introduce the learners to the nuances of commercial translation thus guiding them on the path of application of the concept

- To introduce the learners to the nuances of collaborative translation thus guiding them on the path of application of the concept

- To introduce the learners to the nuances of audio visual, subtitling and dubbing thus enabling them to apply the theory to actual practice

2.1 INTRODUCTION

The scope of translation is not confined to the practice of translating a text from one language to another but the study is also inclusive of an important practice that in a way contributes to the building of harmony between different languages, conveying meanings of words from a language into another. Use of dictionaries is a common practice in learning and getting acquainted to a foreign or any other language different from one's mother tongue. Dictionaries thus play an important role in bridging the gap between two languages. The art of producing dictionaries and organizing the information in the dictionaries thus forms

an important part of the translation studies. The notion of bilingual dictionaries and the way these dictionaries are organized and produced also becomes an interesting area to know about.

Especially with the advent of technology and globalization, as we are aware, the practice of translation has gained tremendous importance commercially. Electronic devices and the internet have significantly contributed to the concept of global village. Treasures of knowledge and literature confined to different regional and national languages are thus getting opened up to the international readership. This has led to creation of opportunities for translators to translate different kinds of texts in legal, commercial and other such areas. Commercial translation is further boosted by a number of online tools for translation which also help the concept of collaborative translation come to reality.

Screening is an undeniable part of the life in 21st century. Like the knowledge and literature, films, TV serials and such commercial shows also look forward to catch the international audience. Though a little more demanding from technological point of view, this scenario has paved new ways for translators in the form of audio-visual subtitling and dubbing.

As a part of this paper in Translation Studies, then, one needs to understand what all these terms exactly refer to.

2.2 LEXICOGRAPHY

The term 'Lexicography' refers to the act of editing and also of producing dictionaries or other reference texts. The scope of its meaning is further expanded to include the compilation and study of dictionaries.

The origin of the concept is rooted in the practice of recording word lists on clay tablets in ancient Sumeria. It is interesting to know that this practice was followed in order to teach people the structure of cuneiform, the system of writing prevalent in the ancient Middle East. People in ancient Greece, India and Egypt also used similar such methods to teach their own languages. The practice thus went on evolving as the languages of these ancient civilizations did.

Gradually, as different civilizations in different parts of the world came into each other's contact and as there was a need to interact with people from other civilizations, there arose a need for translation. The discipline thus accommodated translations as a part of it.

In the semantic and functional sense, the term lexicography can be categorized under

• Practical Lexicography

• Theoretical Lexicography

The former deals with producing dictionaries and includes the act of 'compiling, writing and editing dictionaries for general as well as specialized use'. The dictionaries thus are made to serve the purpose of

helping people with an authoritative reference for the meaning of words and also of guiding them on the way those words to be pronounced and spelt.

The latter studies the organization of dictionaries. The discipline, in short, aims at research that can contribute to creation of better dictionaries. It helps in improving the organization and structure of information provided thus making it more usable. The discipline also includes a needs analysis of the users in specialized industries and the way in which dictionary information is accessed. For example, Webster's New World Medical Dictionary includes the terminology used in medical profession.

Unfortunately, the art of lexicography is considered a job that requires "neither the light of learning, nor the activity of genius" (Johnson: 1747 cited in Hausmann). As Hausmann puts it, the art is 'often overlooked and relegated to being a mere craft rather than an academic discipline.' European Association of Lexicography (EURALEX), at its XVII International Congress, held in 2016, adopted a resolution addressing the UNESCO, governments of all the nations as well as research funding agencies and universities to acknowledge lexicography as an academic discipline. The resolution mentioned the need of 'novel types of dictionaries' in the present multilingual world and also emphasized the fact that without proper recognition and support, it is not possible to have such dictionaries.

The term finds an essential space in the context of translation studies because, as already mentioned in the introduction, translation performs an important function of bringing harmony between two languages. These two disciplines have much in common yet there are differences too. Rigual and Calvi (2014) point out that considering the important aspect of equivalence which is common in both translation and lexicography, the former expects it to be context-based whereas in the latter, context is 'left aside'. But still, the two share an important relationship.

The tools used by translators include different types of dictionaries besides encyclopaedia. Bilingual dictionary is one such used very commonly.

Bilingual Dictionaries

A bilingual dictionary also known as translation dictionary is used specifically for translating words or phrases from one language to another. It lists the meanings of words of a language in another and can also allow translation to and from both languages. The dictionary that performs both these functions is known bidirectional bilingual dictionary. It generally includes two sections each of which lists words or phrases of a language alphabetically with its translation. The part of speech, gender, verb type and other grammatical clues are also indicated in the bilingual dictionary in addition to the translation of the word. Apart from this, list of phrases, usage and style guides, verb tables, maps and grammar references also may be added to the translation of words.

According to Mackintosh (1998), bilingualized dictionaries are the best tool for specialized translation into L2. Manning (1990:159 cited in Gauton: 2008) has also called it the translator' basic tool which acts as the bridge making 'interlingual transfer possible'. Pinchuck (1977:223) has, however, called it a 'very dangerous tool' for translator though he accepts the importance of the tool. According to Swanepoel (1989), bilingual dictionary has limitations because it falls short in providing sufficient information as regards the user's overall competence in the target language and cannot contribute to enrich his/her 'grasp of the text's socio-cultural context'. As the process of translation requires total communicative competence on the part of translator for this overall grasp of the text, bilingual dictionary cannot be the best tool.

Zgusta (1971:323) and Al-Kasimi (1983:61) as cited in Gauton (2008), suggest that the bilingual lexicographer may not always find the necessary equivalents in the TL like for culture-bound words. It is also applicable to the grammatical categories and parts of speech as languages differ in this sense. There can be some lexical units which may not have an equivalent in another language. For example, in an Indian language, a person can use an expression like '*vahi to*' to assert what s/he has already said. But to translate the same, s/he cannot get an equivalent in English and merely has to say, '*exactly*' which is not an exact equivalent for the unit.

Gauton(2008) opines that the translator faces almost similar problems as those faced by the lexicographer while compiling a bilingual dictionary. Pinchuck (1977) has cautioned the translators that they always need to remember that a dictionary is always out of date and many of the recorded expressions may not be in common use. A possibility is also mentioned by Pinchuck that the expressions considered as colloquial or non-standard might have found a place in formal usage and the expressions newly introduced in the language might not have been recorded in the dictionary. Neubert (1992) therefore advises the user to possess a realistic attitude. It is thus suggested by Neubert that bilingual dictionary needs to 'choose between either defining the meaning of an L1 item or translating it by way of L2 material.

Pinchuck expects the user of a bilingual dictionary to extend maximum possible co-operation and contribute maximum understanding of his/her mother tongue so as to successfully interpret the bilingual dictionary and opines that the bilingual dictionary should be used as a last resort. However, in spite of these shortcomings of a bilingual dictionary, Pinchuck has listed some features of a good bilingual dictionary wherein he has mentioned that possibly wide range of application for each item should be furnished by the dictionary. It should also provide its complete grammatical details and the level of usage of the equivalent provided.

Considering the limitations of bilingual dictionaries in terms of lack of equivalents (known as anisomorphism), Baker and Kaplan (1994 cited in Gauton: 2008) suggest an alternative in the form of a new type of bilingual dictionary which they call 'bridge bilinguals. These are

13

translated versions of monolingual dictionaries. These translate the explanation into the TL or the user's mother tongue.

2.3 COMMERCIAL AND COLLABORATIVE TRANSLATION

Commercial Translation:

According to Koby (2012), when a text is translated from the source language into another target language by a professional translator for a commercial purpose and for remuneration, often with short deadlines, it is called commercial translation. There are translation agencies that assign translation jobs to freelance translators using a 'translate-edit-proof' model. Thus, a translator translates a text, a second translator in the same language pair verifies the accuracy and revises the translation done and then a proof reader again verifies the target text for correctness.

However, as mentioned in the 51 Types of Translation by Pan Tranz, commercial translation is a very generic, wide-ranging type of translation and includes other more specialized forms of translation like legal, financial and technical.

Considering the present global and technologically advanced scenario of business and any other field of work, especially when people heavily depend upon electronic reference services, a translator needs to possess a good technical ability to use maximum possible online tools. The treasures of knowledge, information as well as creative content available in different regional and national languages are finding its way to the global readership through translated texts. Translation, in this way, has gained much importance in the present world. Following are some of the digital tools available for translators today:

• Linguee: It combines a dictionary with a search engine. It also helps with a web search for relevant translated documents and thus guides on how a word is translated throughout the internet. The best part is that it also uses Google Images with the linguistic items so as to help the translators.

• The Free Dictionary: It provides a dictionary, thesaurus and encyclopaedia in one. • Fluency Now

• MemoQ

• Translators Café

However, while dealing in the international market, the translator needs to be very careful so that the content becomes easy for the target audience to understand. Baldridge (2020) is of the opinion that to make one's content globally acceptable, it is necessary for the translator to concentrate on internationalization than on localization.

Collaborative Translation:

This practice is as old as translation but has recently attracted the attention of scholars in the field of Translation Studies. (Cordingley and Manning:2017 cited in Huss, 2018) Technological innovations have made it possible for multiple participants to collaborate on the same text simultaneously with the help of computer. Thus, collaborative translation is a technique of translation involving multiple translators simultaneously using computer assisted translation interface which also includes tools for collaboration. Collaborative translation is often confused with crowdsourcing techniques. But it is necessary to remember that collaborative translation is, as mentioned earlier, the technique of involving multiple translation participants with shared resources. On the other hand, crowdsourcing means assigning translation tasks to a group of individuals via a flexible open call. Collaborative translation helps in reducing the total time of translation lifecycle whereas crowdsourcing aims at simplifying the translation assignment phase of the lifecycle and to reduce translation rates.

One of the disadvantages is the result of this activity. Generally it may lead to a lower quality of translation as all of the translators may not be certified translators. Some companies may use this system and abuse it so as to save money by getting the documents freely translated.

For example, the website cucumis.org provides an opportunity to different people and their different linguistic skills to be connected online.

Such collaborative platform brings people together breaking down the barriers.(Passos: 2019). Such a collaborative activity reduces the tedious task of retranslating and editing as more than one translators collaborate for a better translation and thus will not need any second thought to be given to the translated text. It is the best combination of humans and machine working together.

2.4 AUDIO VISUAL SUBTITLING AND DUBBING

Due to the advent of globalization and technological innovations, the makers of a movie or a TV series, post release in the country of its origin, aspire to reach out to the international audience with the onscreen product. This has created a huge demand for the audio-visual translation services. The technological advancement and the rise of media-streaming companies like Netflix have further boosted this activity. Subtitling and dubbing are the two major types of such translation. Audio-visual translation mainly aims at synchronization of verbal and non-verbal components.

The translators working on audio-visual translation assignments need to consider several aspects of media art like sound effects, image and atmosphere of the video, apart from the text.

According to Chaume (2013), audio-visual translation is a 'mode of translation characterized by the transfer of audio-visual texts either

interlingually or intralingually.' It is relatively a new area of translation studies as compared to the translation of literary works. The terms 'subtitling' and 'dubbing' refer to the translation of an audio dialogue available in video format like an online video clip, movie or a TV show. Subtitling involves a written translation of spoken dialogue displayed on screen simultaneously with the audio. According to Cintas (2006), subtitles are 'mostly condensed translations of original dialogue which is displayed on the screen as lines of text generally towards the foot of the screen. Dubbing, on the other hand, refers to replacing the spoken dialogue with a simultaneous spoken translation. It is many times confused with the term 'voiceover'. Dubbing can be done post-production and post-release of the audio-visual. *Scrooge or Marley's Ghost* (1901) was the first movie with inter-titles.

Subtitling is far less expensive as compared to dubbing. But the main disadvantage here is that the audience concentrates on the text of these subtitles more and thus may miss on the actual visual experience. Subtitling is a translation process taking place at two levels, between languages and between the spoken and written word. Generally subtitling does not aim at exact translation but it is a more concise translation.

In case of both, subtitling and dubbing, choice of words may happen to be tricky in the situations where there is no equivalent in the TL. For example, humour that depends on puns or play on words in one language, the foreign audience belonging to different linguistic group may find it difficult to understand the punchline thus leading to the film to lose its original appeal and impact. Some other problem areas faced by the translators in AV translation are characters' speech peculiarities full of dialects, accents and slangs. It is a major challenge for them as regards the reproduction of all cultural and linguistic specifications in the translation. In case of writing subtitles, the translator always needs to be aware of the average reading speed of the viewers.

Dubbing involves post synchronized re-voicing. Voices of the persons other than the on screen actors who speak in a language different from the source language are recorded in synchronization with the film image. The original spoken text and the target text are adjusted to fit the visual lip movements of the original utterance.

Sometimes, sound effects or spoken lines by the original actors in the source language are also called dubbing. This takes place when the sound quality of the original recording is poor. P. Reich (2006) mentions that the translation for dubbing is not the final product offered to the audience and that it is "a half-finished product" which requires further work.

2.5 CONCLUSION

The field of lexicography and the act of producing/ compiling the bilingual dictionaries, though sound uninteresting, do have to its credit multiple opportunities to be explored along with interesting challenges for a translator with a zest for creativity and curiosity. It is equally interesting

area for a research-oriented mind. One's acquaintance with the terms like commercial and collaborative translation certainly enriches the vision and motivates the would-be translators to explore such opportunities commercially. The field of audio-visual translation in the form of subtitling and dubbing opens up one more door to commercial opportunities in the field of translation.

2.6 CHECK YOUR PROGRESS

1. Define Lexicography. Explain how lexicography is an interesting area to be explored in the field of research.

2. Write a note on Bilingual Dictionaries.

3. Explain how commercial translation is an upcoming prospective career for the translators in the present world.

4. Write a note on Collaborative Translation.

5. 'Audio visual translation in the form of subtitling and dubbing is a challenging yet interesting store of opportunities for translators.' Explain.

2.7 BIBLIOGRAPHY

• Audio-visual Translation: Dubbing or Sub-titles? (2018).

• https://termcoord.eu/2018/05/audiovisual-translation-dubbing-or-subtitles/ Accessed on 15th November, 2022.

• Fontenelle, T. *Bilingual Dictionaries: History and Development*.

• https://doi.org/10.1093/oxfordhb/9780199691630.013.4 (2016)

• https://academic.oup.com/edited-volume/34561/chapter

• abstract/293267571?redirectedFrom=fulltext

• Gabriel, J. 16 Online Translation Tools Recommended by Translators. gengo.com/community/15-online-translation-tools-translators/ (2019). Accessed on 12th November, 2022.

• Gauton, R. Bilingual Dictionaries, the Lexicographer and the Translator. *Lexikos* 18 (AFRILEX-reeks/series 18: 2008): 106-118.

• https://www.ajol.info/index.php/lex/article/view/47246/33626 Accessed on November, 8th, 2022.

• Hausmann, Franz J. Once Again Why Lexicography is Science.

• https://www.researchgate.net/publication/331645953_Once_Again_Why_Lexicography_Is_Science Accessed on November, 6, 2022.

- Huss, J. Collaborative Translation. *Routledge Handbook of Literary Translation.* (pp. 389- 406). (May, 2018).

- https://www.researchgate.net/publication/324964040_Collaborative_Translation \

- Jorge Diaz Cintas, Díaz Cintas, Jorge. (2006). Audiovisual Translation in the Third Millennium. In: Anderman , G. & Rogers, M. (Eds) *Translation Today: Trends and Perspectives*. Beijing: Foreign Language Teaching and Research Press. 192-204 (Beijing: Foreign Language Teaching and Research Press., 2006), 192–204

- Koby, G. (2012). Commercial Translation.

- https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/10.1002/9781405198431.wbeal0156 Accessed on November, 8th, 2022.

- Lexicography History, Focus & Importance

- https://study.com/learn/lesson/lexicography-history-focus-importance.html. Accessed on 8th November, 2022.

- Matkivska, N. Audiovisual Translation: Conception, Types, Characters' Speech and Translation Strategies Applied. *Studies about Languages*. (2014).

- https://kalbos.ktu.lt/index.php/KStud/article/view/8516/4304 Accessed on 14th November, 2022.

- Olohan, M. Commercial Translation. *Handbook of Translation Studies* Volume 1 (2010), pp. 41–44. ISSN 2210-4844 | E-ISSN© 2010–2016 John Benjamins Publishing Company. https://benjamins.com/online/hts/articles/comm1 Accessed on 14th November, 2022.

- Passos, L. 3 Benefits of a Collaborative Translation Platform. (2019). https://www.bureauworks.com/blog/3-benefits-of-a-collaborative-translation-platform-fc/. Accessed on 12th November, 2022.

- Pettit, Z. The Audio-Visual Text: Subtitling and Dubbing Different Genres. (2004). https://id.erudit.org/iderudit/009017ar Accessed on 15th November, 2022.

- Rigual, C. and Calvi, M. Translation and Lexicography: A Necessary Dialogue. *MonTI* 6 (2014: 37-62). ISSN 1889-4178. http://dx.doi.org/10.6035/MonTI.2014.6.1. Accessed on 11th November, 2022.

- Supardi, M. and Putri, D. A. Audio-Visual Translation: Subtitling and Dubbing Technique - Movie Soundtrack in Frozen: Let it go. *Buletin Al-Turas*. https://journal.uinjkt.ac.id/index.php/al-turats/article/download/8621/4968 Accessed on 16th November, 2022.

- Tranz, Pan. 51 Types of Translation.

- https://www.infomarex.com/uploaded_files/159879466851%20types%20of%20translation.pdf Accessed on 12th November, 2022.

- Voice-over and dubbing.
  https://www.linguaserve.com/en/multilingual-services/

- Xavier Michel. Collaborative Translation: A New Approach to Translation. https://mastertcloc.unistra.fr/2017/04/10/collaborative-translation/ (2017). Accessed on 12th November, 2022.

- https://www.bell-foundation.org.uk/eal-programme/guidance/effective-teaching-of-eal learners/great-ideas/bilingual-dictionaries/. Accessed on 8th November, 2022.

- https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Collaborative_translation

- https://www.acclaro.com/blog/subtitling-and-dubbing/

❖ ❖ ❖ ❖

TYPES OF TRANSLATION-PROCESS AND PROBLEMS - TRANSLATION OF PROSE, FICTION AND POETRY

Unit Structure

3.0   Objectives

3.1   Introduction

3.2   Process of Translating Prose Text

3.3   Process of Translating Poetry

3.4   Conclusion

3.5   Check Your Progress

3.0 OBJECTIVES

- To acquaint the readers with the process of translation of fiction and prose.

- To make the reader aware of the problems encountered by the translator while translating fiction: novels, short stories and essays.

- To analyze linguistic, aesthetic and cultural problems while translating fiction and prose.

- To make the reader aware of the problems encountered by the translator while translating poetry

- To analyze Linguistic, Aesthetic and cultural problems while translating poetry.

- To acquaint the students with the loss and gain in literary translation and the strategies applied.

- To make the readers aware of the typical issues the translator faces as drama is a performing art.

3.1 INTRODUCTION

Translation involves a transfer of meaning from one language to another. Hence, the process of translation involves various stages of decoding and re-coding. Further, translation involves various steps that are related to reading, revision, proofreading and finding equivalence. This process of literary translation is described, in detail, in this unit. Further,

Translating literary works has always been more difficult than translating other types of text because literary works have specific values called aesthetic and expressive values. The aesthetic function of the work emphasizes the beauty of the words (diction), figurative language, metaphors, etc., on the other hand, expressive functions deal with the writer's thought (or process of thought), emotion, etc. When it comes to translation issues, the translator should try, at his best, to transfer these specific values into the target language.

Translating literary works has always been more difficult than translating other types of text because literary works have specific values called aesthetic and expressive values. The aesthetic function of the work emphasizes the beauty of the words (diction), figurative language, metaphors, etc., on the other hand, expressive functions deal with the writer's thought (or process of thought), emotion, etc. When it comes to translation issues, the translator should try, at his best, to transfer these specific values into the target language.

As a literary genre, drama is only realized in performance. As a literary form, it is designed for the theatre because characters are assigned roles and they act out their roles as the action is enacted on the stage. Drama is also said to be a theatrical craft. In the domain of literary translation, poetry is the most challenging of all genres. The translator using her / his skill and creativity can apply the strategies to overcome the problems of translation. Ultimately, it is the meaning and also the form of the texts that need to be transferred. Let's discuss the issues one by one.

3.2 PROCESS OF TRANSLATING PROSE TEXT:

In the case of experimental fiction particularly the prosaic one, a translator has to be very careful in bringing out the qualities of the SL text into TL text. Hillaire Belioc has laid down six rules for the translator of prose texts.

1) The translator should not plead on, word by word or sentence by sentence but should block his work that is to consider the work as an integral unit.

2) The translator should translate idiom by idiom.

3) The translator should render intention by intention.

4) Belioc warns against less fund amiss, those words or structures that may appear to correspond in both SL and TL but accurately do not.

5) The translator is advised to translate boldly.

6) The translator should never embellish.

Newmark suggests that a short story is the most difficult one in translating as the translator has to bring in the clonelike effect in TL text.

3.2.1. Problems in Translation of Prose and Fiction

The issues in translating prose are less complicated than issues in fiction. Through the centuries many theories have been formulated by experts in the field to help translators make better translations. But no theory is so comprehensive that the translators do not have any problems. The translation is a challenging activity and few difficulties emerge throughout the translation process since every language diversely portrays the world and has its grammar structure, grammar rules and syntax variance.

A translator of fiction has to bear certain points in mind before setting ahead with the act properly. Instead of beginning at the beginning of the text right away, he must study the work thoroughly and analyze its underlying significance. He must be able to identify the spirit and the varying tones. He must study stylistic factors such as sentence arrangement, word order, use of pronouns, questions, repetitions etc. He must take care to abstain from making negative shifts like misinterpretation, superficial interpretation, sub-interpretation etc. His preoccupation should not be only with content. Instead, he must view the work as a whole. He must view every individual sentence, and every word as a part of the total structure. He must be able to identify the symbolic, metaphoric or deliberately decharacterised terms, repetition, and their purpose and role in making up the text. If the translator is concerned only with the content, then he is likely to lose the other dimensions of the novel.

The most particular problems that the translators face include- illegible text, missing references, several constructions of grammar, dialect terms and neologisms, irrationally vague terminology, inexplicable acronyms and abbreviations, untranslatability, intentional misnaming, particular cultural references etc. Nonetheless, some theorists think that 'literal translation is not possible. They present three main reasons supporting their stance:

1. Because a particular word in one language often contains meanings that involve several words in another language. For example, the English word 'wall' might be rendered in German as *Wand* (inside wall) or as *Mauer* (exterior wall),

2. Because grammatical particles (verb tenses, singular/dual/plural, case markers etc.) are not available in every language, and

3. Because idioms of one language and culture may be utterly perplexing to speakers from another language and culture.

Translation of fiction involves the exchange of the social experience of individuals in the fictional world with readers in another culture or society. Both the social factor and the authorial factor (authorial individualism) are emphasized in the process of fiction translation. The two kinds of style i.e., authorial style and text style concern both social and authorial factors of fiction and distinguish one novel/short story from another. Therefore, the reproduction of style (both authorial style and text style) is considered

the core of the translation of fiction. It is also a difficult task for the translator of fiction to explore the style of a novel/short story and the message the author conveys about social life, human relationships, etc.

Prose fiction has a much greater social influence than the other two literary genres. Translation of fiction depends largely on various factors, including aesthetic conventions, historical and cultural-social circumstances, authorial individualism and the author's worldview, among which reproduction of the fictional style is regarded as its core. Neither the linguistic, communicative, nor philological approach can cover all the features of fiction translation. Although the introduction of literary stylistics to the translation of fiction brings out a new perspective in the study of fiction translation and particularly emphasizes stylistic analysis, it is limited to the study of the translation of the text style, leaving out the authorial style, which has a wider scope involving social, cultural and ideological factors. The socio-semiotic approach takes into consideration various aspects of the philological, linguistic, communicative, and other approaches of translation and extends considerably the base for recognizing the meaningfulness of both lexical contents, rhetoric form and cultural-social value. Therefore, it is relatively comprehensive. We consider it the best approach to studying the translation of fiction and solving the potential problems in the translation of fiction.

3.2.1.1. Culture-Based Problems in Translation

From a particular translated work of art, the readers can understand the bliss and sufferings of the native people. The TL readers can also understand the culture followed by a particular group of people. Through the translated works even common people can know about the culture, behaviour, sufferings, and gender harassment of other natives. Culture is the way of living of a particular sector of people. 'Cultural language' is to be distinguished from 'Universal language' and 'Personal languages. Universal words such as "breakfast", "embrace", and "pile", often cover the universal function but not the cultural description. "thali", "kunggumam", "chittappa", "metti" are all culture-based words. These above SL words cannot be translated by replacing the exact TL words.

In any TL text, a total linguistic or cultural equivalence is difficult to be achieved. The translator has to integrate various strategies to communicate most effectively. Ivir (1987) lists procedures and strategies to fill up the cultural 'gaps. In 'Ghisa' the translator adopts various strategies but at times due to cultural differences, linguistic inequality occurs and therefore cultural communications suffer. For example-

SL Text Words	SL Text Words
Lipa-poti	This expression is peculiar to mud houses but when translated as 'Plastered and painted' the rustic flavor is lost.
Ghara	When translated as 'jar' fails to bring the exact image of Indian style 'pot'.

| Kurta | English has no substitute for the word 'Kurta' in fact it is translated as 'Shirt'. |
| Dakshina | In English culture, this concept does not occur. The word "Tribute" appears to be imprecise. |

Hence to convey the proper culture, sometimes the dialectical words of SL are translated as it is to give the cultural image effectively. Some other words such as 'Namaskar', 'Jalebi', and 'Guru Saheb' are used in the same form in TL to maintain the cultural effect.

The encounter with an alien culture world, in the first instance amounts to a confrontation of two heterogeneous sensibilities which are conditioned by the intrinsic value system of their respective culture. Such a confrontation would most probably evoke resistance to experience the alterity or the otherness of the alien cultures.

Translation from language to language is in fact translation from culture to culture. Bassnett believes that translation must take place within a framework of culture. Translation as cross-cultural communication must be made both on a linguistic basis and a cultural one because language and culture are so interdependent that one implies the other.

Surveying the cultural structure, we categorize the implicit assumptions and premises that govern the behaviors of human beings into the deep structure of culture i.e., the psychological system including worldviews, value systems, national characteristics, aesthetic standards and thinking patterns, and their sub-categories which are the crucial cultural mechanism that produces the differences in psychological characteristics at the individual level. And it is this deep underlying structure that makes each culture unique, affects the ways the mind works, and determines the way a person perceives, processes and responds to the information from the environment. Thus, when we see translation as cross-cultural communication, we first all see translations as the valid transfer of cultural psychology on the base of fidelity. Then come up with two translation principles- fidelity and validity.

Let us illustrate with Rajender Bedi's novel *"Ek Chadar Maili Si"* and Khushwant Singh's translation of it as *"I Take This Woman"*. The central issue in *"Ek Chadar Maili Si"* is the accepted social practice of a younger brother marrying his elder brother's widow, the meaning of which is symbolically revealed in the word "Chadar" and the half-protection it offers, the vulnerability it both protects and exposes in emotional and economic terms is accentuated by the word "Maili". The Urdu title literally means "A Soiled Sheet or Mantle". The translated title does not contain the sense of compulsion and necessity underlying this social practice. It shifts the emphasis to the final one of conflict which is present in the novel.

The viewpoint of the author, the theme of the work, and the lingual and extra-lingual methods used thus form a threefold base on which the creative act stands. And it is on this base alone that the translator can

construct the translated structure. The translator has no liberty to add or take away anything. Thus, if the creative writer has used symbols and images the translated work should be communicable without further explanation.

A dialect is a form of language which is spoken in a particular part of a country and contains some different words, grammar and pronunciation from other forms of the same language. No language is monolithic in character; there are varieties within each language. No single language is superior or inferior to another language on any grounds. Some particular features of one language may differ from another language.

The distinction can be observed in the use of Kinship terms**.** If the speaker of the SL passage is addressing the lady of her neighbouring house as "mami" or as "mama". The use of kinship terms" mami" or "mama" is not necessarily used only among the relatives. In the TL also, such reference among non-relatives exists and so the SL term "mami" or "mama" has been translated as "aunty" or "uncle" respectively in its informal reference. Such non-linguistic societal customs should be taken into consideration by the translator. In the SL, kinship term like "cittappa" is referred to using only the TL kinship term "uncle". Some sector people address other ladies as "mami" even though they are not relatives. Likewise, the SL terms like "attai", "mami", "citti" have only one referent in the TL, i.e., aunt.

The translation of fiction struggles with the problem of conveying the peculiar use of language- especially idioms, and phrases from one social context to another. For example, the word 'neech'- to few is a person of so-called 'low-caste' but to some, it may mean 'cunning'. Similarly, the word 'gharjamai' can hardly be explained by translating it literally as 'son-in-law' staying in the house of 'in-laws', whereas in the Indian context it is taken in a derogatory insulting sense.

3.2.1.2. Linguistics-Based Problems in Translation

A general comparison of the phonological character of English and Marathi is interesting. It seems that the Marathi word has a greater load of vowels and consonants than English. A passage from Eliot (translated by Vilas Sarang) contains 154 words in English and 125 words in the Marathi translation. The original passage has 222 vowel sounds in English while in Marathi translation it has 366 vowel sounds. The original has 362 consonant sounds in English and 399 consonant sounds in the Marathi translation.

English has a large number of monosyllabic words while Marathi has relatively few. Secondly, the use of inflections makes Marathi words longer. Eliot's line- 'woods move, music move, only in time. The English word 'move' has 2 consonants and 1 vowel sound. The Marathi equivalent 'saraktet' has 5 consonants and 4 vowel sounds. Marathi is phonologically more cluttered than English. Thirdly, Marathi seems to be more saturated with vowels than English. One reason could be the greater existence of monosyllabic words in English which often sandwich a vowel between

two consonants. English seems to give the impression of certain crispness while Marathi has a large flood of vowel sounds.

In transcribing Hindi proper names, one has to be aware of the phonological system of both Hindi and English. If the transcribed form happens to be homophonous to another word in English which sounds objectionable then the translator must modify the transcription of the word. The Hindi proper name 'Dixit' should not be transcribed as 'Dikshit'. However, the problems of transcription from Hindi into English are not as troublesome as problems at other levels of grammar.

Syntactic Fragmentation

Marathi is a highly inflected language, but English is not. An inflected language gives greater freedom to its uses since the change in the order of words does not necessarily affect its grammatical structure.

Ambiguity in English-Marathi translation may also occur due to the absence of definite and indefinite articles in Marathi. A simple proverb like "An apple a day keeps the doctor away" can be translated as "Roz ek safarchand khaoo, doctor pasun dur rahu". Here actually the meaning of the proverb is related to health and cannot be translated as it is in Marathi.

Syntactic Suspense

This is related to the direct address technique in the writing of fiction which is commonly seen in English and suspense is created. But in Hindi or Marathi, it is difficult to achieve.

For example: "Oh! My love I die for thee". When translated into Marathi or Hindi the essence of the direct address and the intense effect in the sentence is lost.

Syntactic Elaboration

A major difference between the structure of an English sentence and that of a Marathi sentence is that in English the main verb normally occurs fairly early, whereas in Marathi it occurs at the very end of the sentence.

For example- In Marathi, the sentence "Mala changle Marathi yete" when translated into English- is "I know Marathi properly". Here the verb 'yete' occurs at the end of the sentence whereas in English the verb 'know' occurs at the start of the sentence.

Phrase Structure

Hindi does not have articles, either definite or indefinite. Definiteness is indicated by other grammatical devices, such as the use of demonstrative pronouns and the numerical "one". Definiteness can also be part of some grammatical constructions such as the relative clause construction and to some extent, topicalization. Correlative Relative Clauses in Hindi are indefinite, whereas Restrictive Relative Clause is definite. Therefore, a

translator should not use a Restrictive Relative Clause for a Hindi Correlative Relative Clause.

For example (a reference to the Hindi novel- Maila Aanchal)- "Jo jotega so boyega", should be translated as "Whoever tills will sow" and not as "the one who tills will sow".

Lexical Problems

The simple difficulty of finding equivalent terms, words, phrases while translating from one language to another is called lexical problem. The dictionary is an obvious help, but it is of limited use-

❖ Words have no exact equivalents in another language.

❖ Even language reflects social and cultural needs.

❖ Words evolve in meaning over some time. What we do is the shades of meaning. For example- In English- Home, House, and Shelter.

In Marathi- Ghar, Hindi- Makan, Ashiyana

Some words describing social customs and practices are difficult to translate because they attain exactness.

For example-

Dahej- Dowry

Ghar Jamai- son-in-law living at in-laws

Bahu beti ki izzat- Honor of daughter-in-law and daughter

Greeting words- Namaskar, Namaste

In English 'Hello', 'Hi' makes no difference whether it is greeted by an older person or younger. The word 'you' in English is equivalent to all age group people and with the same respect whereas in Urdu we have words like 'tu', 'tum', and 'aap' according to age group and a mark of respect.

The translator should use slang and Dialects in the colloquial language of TL.

The meaning of a word in Hindi does not accurately map onto the domain of a similar English word. For example- 'hasna' in Hindi means 'laugh' as well as 'smile' in English. In translation it is hard to decide between "Baldev said it with a smile" and "Baldev said it with laughter" (Novel-Maila Aanchal).

Idiomatic phrases are always a problem. For example, consider "log haste haste lot pot ho gaye". A literal translation would be "people rolled on the ground with laughter. Actually, it should be translated as, "people burst into laughter".

3.3 PROCESS OF TRANSLATING POETRY

The translator of a poetic text first reals / translates the SL and then through a further process of decoding, translates the text into the target language in it, he is not doing less than the reader of the SL text alone, he is doing more, for the SL text is being approached through more than is set of systems. The interlingual translation is bound to reflect the translator's creative interpretation of the SL text. Moreover, the degree to which the translator reproduces the form, meter rhyme, rhythm, tone, register and so on of the SL text will be determined by the TL system as by the SL system and will also depend on the function of the translation. Andre Lefebvre catalogues seven different strategies for translating a poem.

1) Phonemic translation, which attempts to reproduce the SL sound of the TL while at the same time producing an acceptable paraphrase of sense.

2) Literal translation, where the emphasis on word-for-word translation distorts the sense and the syntax of the original.

3) Metrical translation where the criterion is the reproduction of the SL meter.

4) Poetry into prose, where distortion of the sense is communicative value and syntax of the SL text results from this method.

5) Rhymed translation, where meter and rhyme are the main considerations of the translator.

6) Blank verse translation, where restrictions are imposed on the translator by the choice of the structure.

7) Interpretation which includes theme and form.

3.3.1. Problems in the Translation of Poetry

Among all literary works, poetry has something special compared to the others. In a poem, beauty is not only achieved with the choice of words and figurative languages like in novels and short stories, but also with the creation of rhythm, rhyme, meter, and specific expressions and structures that may not conform to the ones of the daily language. In short, the translation of poetry needs 'something more than translating other genres of literature.

Compared with fiction and drama, the terse culture-specific use of words in poetry makes it relatively difficult to achieve any adequate or definitive translation. Different rhetorical devices such as symbol, analogy, allusion, simile, or ironic counterpoints produce complexity in poetry. A poem employs a variety of influences, which are literary and cultural, historical and mythical, and universal and topical. The use of a foreign language for translating distorts some of the subtleties of the native experience. Since English does not have as strong a cultural basis as a regional poetic tradition has concerning the use of the resources of folk culture and folk

tradition, poetry translation poses a series of problems and difficulties. Despite such problems in poetry translation, various attempts have been made to make translate poetry into different languages.

Translatability is a major issue in the context of literary genres. As literary language has a balance between form and content, and it relies on a hidden network of suggestions; the translator has to be alive to the nuances of the text. It is, as Robert Scholes points out "a complex structural system working within the larger structure of literature as a whole. The translator has to recognize the balance between these often-dialectical systems. It is to be noted that the translator is first a reader of the text and then an interpreter."

Gayatri Spivak in her essay The Politics of Translation discusses translation as the most intimate act of reading. She writes, *"I surrender to the text when I translate."* **(Venuti: 398).** The translator has to read with care and sensitivity and note the cultural context in which the text is rooted. To an extent, this reading also involves interpretation. This surrendering to the text brings out several issues in translation which are mainly on three levels:

1- Linguistic Issues

2- Literary or Aesthetic Issues

3- Cultural Issues

3.3.1.1. Linguistic Issues:

The linguistic problems in translating verse are twofold; the words and meaning, on one hand, whereas the flow and rhythm on the other hand.

The words and meaning embody certain issues related to the images, similes, metaphors, culture-specific words, phrasal verbs, idioms, punned expressions, enjambment and grammar of both the TL text and the SL text.

The most difficult challenge while translating literary texts is found in the differences between cultures. People of a given culture look at things from their perspective. Larson notes that **"different cultures have different focuses. Some societies are more technical and others less technical."** This difference is reflected in the amount of vocabulary which is available to talk about a particular topic (Larson 1984:95). Larson adds that there may also be both "technical and non-technical" vocabulary that is available to talk about the same thing within a given society.

Other difficulties of translation are regarding the idioms and phrasal verbs. An idiom is an expression peculiar to a language and not readily understandable from its grammatical construction or the meaning of its parts. It is considered that the living language of any country is idiomatic.

According to the structuralist point of view, grammar is the study of the rules governing the use of a language. That set of rules is also called the

grammar of the language, and each language has its distinct grammar. Hence, for any translator, grammar becomes a matter of concern. As the complete language system of any society depends on its grammatical rules, so, for the translator, grammatical knowledge of both, the TL and SL become necessary.

Flow and rhythm cause another problem in translation. As the rhyme, rhythm, alliteration, assonance, consonance, etc., produce musicality in any poem, hence its existence becomes important. But most of the time it is observed that these musical elements, which are the beauty of the poems, are somewhat lost in translation.

The problem of sounds and cadence confronting the translator with difficulties cannot always be fully overcome. Sounds make poetry translation even more difficult due to the particular meaning, and the music, attached to them. Specifically, alliteration limits the strength of translation. There are many cases where translators have to sacrifice both sound and cadence to keep to meaning.

The highly rhymed poems constitute another hindrance for the translator of poetry, not to mention for the translator of English where it is harder to find rhymed poems than in most languages. In this case, the translator should answer the question of how important it is to keep to the poet's rhyme and how necessary it is to find rhymes in the target language to match the rhymes of the original. The same applies in the case of meter where the translator has to decide whether the poems in meter have to be in meter too when translated, taking into consideration that meter is not natural in all languages. The issue of the meter is even more important since the meter sets the tone and mood of the whole piece. The translator should also take into consideration the purposes for which both rhyme and meter have been used. Tense too matters a lot in the translation of poetry.

The translator faces a challenge when he has no equivalent linguistic means to create the same effect. The issue of whether he can add an image of his own as an equivalent one for the target language then arises. It is at this point that translating becomes a challenging task.

However, we should not dismiss the translation of poetry as "impossible". On the contrary, translation has advanced and enriched civilizations by breaking down barriers of time, place, language and cultural differences. If the translator applies the correct translation tools, poetry translation is a feasible task. The evidence of masterly created translations indicates that a skilled translator can achieve a high-standard translation with the majority of the source text's features kept intact and only a partial semantic and stylistic loss.

The verse is an integral part of poetic form. It is the minimum requirement that differentiates prose from poetry. Some poems by their versification are not amenable to translation for instance: -

"A is for apple which lies in the grass,

B is for beer which forth in the glass,

C is for curry which we love to eat,

D is for dumplings which are a real treat".

Such poems where there is a verbal play on the alphabet of a particular language cannot be rendered into another language. Then, there are poems with a special rhyme scheme which poses an insurmountable hurdle in translation. A traditional rhyme for preschool children is a case in point: -

"One, two, buckle my shoe

Three, Four, shut the door

Five, six, pick up sticks

Seven, eight, lock the gate

Nine, ten starts again"

A translation of these lines is almost impossible for obvious reasons in the above-quoted instances, the style and sense are so well blended that it is hardly translatable. More importantly, a strictly personal or language-based poem allows no translation. The translation is required of poetry which transcends barriers of time and clime and heightens our perception of existence and experience as manifest in such lines.

"To see a world in a grain of sand

And heaven in a wildflower

Hold infinity in the palm of your hand

And eternity in an hour"

When a poet exhorts the readers in this way, his words reverberate through any mind that captures their sense and significance.

Such pieces are translatable and should be translated. This is the reason why myriads of readers without knowledge of Latin and Greek have enjoyed the works of Homer and Virgil. But even the translation of such poems is not sans its share of constraints and problems for the translator.

A translator of poetry first decides what constitutes the total structure and then resolves the problems in one way or another, through a pragmatic approach, while translating a type of poetry that relies on a series of rules that are non-existent in the TL.

English meter differs radically from the Marathi meter. In English, stress is the basic element whereas in Marathi the length of the syllable is important. For example, in Marathi the meter i.e., '2 Maatra' is a long syllable and with'1 maatra' is a short syllable.

The most common meter in Marathi is the 'Pedukalaka'- consisting of 16 lines with a rhythmic break in the middle of each line dividing it into two equal parts. The verse forms of traditional, devotional and folk poetry like 'abhang' and 'ovi' are more natural to Marathi poets. Most of the Marathi poets write in free verse. For a translator translating such type of piece into English becomes a challenging task for the translator.

Here is an example of Karandikar's translation of some of his 'abhangs' in English in the form of the original. The result is not encouraging.

Let the neck escape/ from the hook of I//

With this anguished cry/ for truth//

The search for truth for truth/is sweet like fire; /

The seeker, on this pyre, / can's rest//

In English dislocation of words and order is liable to create ambiguities. In Gray's famous "Elegy", the line- "And all the air a solemn stillness holds", is grammatically ambiguous. One may read it as "all the air holds a solemn stillness" or as "a solemn stillness holds all the air". In Marathi, on the other hand, such ambiguity would not arise for the object of 'holds' as it takes the appropriate inflection.

Dr. Sarang illustrates this by taking a famous line from modern Marathi poet- Mardhekar- "*pipat mele olya undir*" which can be roughly translated as "rats (or mice) died in the wet barrel". If the word order is retained it becomes "in the barrel died wet rats" resulting in a misinterpretation of the text implying that 'not' is the attribute of 'rats' while the correct rendering is "rats died in the wet barrel". Dilip Chitre translates it as "mice in the wet barrel died". Here the original effect is lost.

Phrase structures too matter. Let us consider the example from "The Waste Land". We observe that prepositions are placed at the beginning of the phrase in English whereas in Marathi they become inflections that end a phrase.

Dialect reflects the speaker's social background. Dr. Sarang refers to Marathi work which uses English and Hindi in Dialect form.

Surve's poem on Nehru's death has a dialogue between two prostitutes. The dialogue is in 'Bombay Hindi" which is translated into English by Dilip Chitre where it loses its effect.

Example-

 "What happened, Sundari? (Asks a harlot)

"Don't burn the incense today. Nehru's gone!

Answer to other

"Really? O.K. then we'll take a night off?"

Here the naturalistic authenticity and the distinctive flavor of Bombay Hindi are lost.

3.3.1.2. Literary or Aesthetic Issues:

Aesthetic values or poetic truth in a poem are conveyed in word order and sounds, as well as in the cognitive sense (logic). And these aesthetic values have no independent meaning, but they are correlative with the various types of meaning in the text. Hence, if the translator destroys the word choice, word order, and sounds, s/he impairs and distorts the beauty of the original poem. Delicacy and gentleness, for instance, are ruins if the translator provides crude alliterations for the original carefully-composed alliterations. So, the problem in translating a verse is how to retain the aesthetic values in the TL text.

The first factor is poetic structure. It is important to note that the structure meant here is the plan of the poem as a whole, the shape and the balance of individual sentences of each line. So, it does not have to relate directly to the sentential structures or grammar of a language, even in fact it is very much affected by the sentential structure. Thus, maintaining the original structure of the poem may mean maintaining the original structure of each sentence.

Another literary or aesthetic factor is sound. As stated before, the sound is anything connected with sound cultivation including rhyme, rhythm, assonance; onomatopoeia, etc. a translator must try to maintain them in the translation. As Newmark (1981:67) further states, "In a significant text, semantic truth is cardinal [meaning is not more or less important, it is important!], whilst of the three aesthetic factors, sound (e.g., alliteration or rhyme) is likely to recede in importance... rhyme is perhaps the most likely factor to 'give'-- rhyming is difficult and artificial enough in one language, reproducing line is sometimes doubly so." In short, if the translation is faced with the condition where s/he has to make a sacrifice, s/he should sacrifice the sound.

Metaphorical expressions are also one of the issues. It means any constructions evoking visual, sounds, touch, and taste images, traditional metaphors, direct comparisons without the words "like' and "as if", and all figurative languages. Intentionally, the writer does not use the term metaphor in the sub-heading since it has a different meaning for some people. What is generally known as a (traditional) metaphor, for example, is not the same as the metaphor meant by Newmark.

The possible question arising now is 'how far a translator can modify the author's metaphorical expressions?' It depends on the importance and expressiveness. If the expressions are very expressive in terms of originality, the expressions should be kept as close as possible to the original, in terms of object, image, sense, and metaphor.

Further, as it is known, there are two kinds of expressions: universal and culturally-bound expressions. Universal expressions are the ones that consist of words having the same semantic field as that of most cultures in

the world. Engkaulah matahariku, for example, is a universal expression for every culture that sees the sun as the source of light, source of energy, and source of life. Therefore, the expression can be simply transferred into 'You are my sun'.

3.3.1.3. Cultural Issues:

In translating culturally-bound expressions, like in other expressions, a translator may apply one or some of the procedures: Literal translation, transference, naturalization, cultural equivalent, functional equivalent, description equivalent, classifier, componential analysis, deletion, couplets, note addition, glosses, reduction, and synonymy. In literal translation, a translator does the unit-to-unit translation. The translation unit may vary from word to larger units such as phrases or clauses.

One applies the 'transference procedure' if s/he converts the SL word directly into TL word by adjusting the alphabet (writing system) only. The result is the 'loan word'. When s/he does only adjust the alphabet but also adjusts it into the normal pronunciation of the TL word, s/he applies naturalization.

In addition, the translator may find the culturally equivalent word of the SL or, if s/he cannot find one, neutralize or generalize the SL word to result in "functional equivalents". When the translator modifies the SL word with a description of form in the TL, the result is description equivalent. Sometimes a translator provides a generic or super ordinate term for a TL word and the result in the TL is called a classifier. And when the translator just supplies the near TL equivalent for the SL word, s/he uses synonymy.

In the componential analysis procedure the translator splits up a lexical unit into its sense components, often one-to-two, one-to-three, or more translations. Moreover, a translator sometimes adds some information, whether he puts it in a bracket or other clause or even a footnote or even deletes unimportant SL words in translation to smooth the result for the reader.

3.3.2. Illustrations of Translated Poems

1) Look at the translation of Wordsworth's poem 'The Solitary Reaper'

The solitary reaper

Behold her, single in the field,

Yon solitary Highland Lass!

Reaping and singing by herself;

Stop here, or gently pass!

Hindi Translation-

एकान्त लावक

उसे निहारना, क्षेत्र में एक,

योन एकान्त हाईलैंड लड़की!

कटाई और खुद से गा;

यहाँ बंद करो, या धीरे पास!

Marathi Translation-

एकटा कापणी करणारा

तिच्या बघ, क्षेत्रात एकल,

पलीकडचा एकटा डोंगराळ प्रदेश मुलगी!

Reaping आणि स्वतद्वारे गात;

येथे थांबा, किंवा हलक्या पास!

In the above example the translator faces linguistics, aesthetic and cultural problems. It's difficult to maintain sentence structure, rhythmic pattern, meter, and sound pattern. Cultural and geographical differences matter. There are no equivalent words for 'Yon' and 'Highland' in Hindi or Marathi. Either one retains the use of the same words or tries to give the most equivalent words to it.

2)   I would further like to give examples of the translation of Urdu verses done by David Matthews and show how he has achieved equivalence in translation and also the loss that occurred during the process of translation:

Dile Nadah tuje hua kya hai? Aaakhir is dard ki dawa kya hai?	My foolish heart! What has become of you? No cure for this pain? What Can I do?
Hum hai mushtaak aur who bezaar Ya Illahi ye manjra kya hai?	I am eager. She is quite offhand. What's this, my God? How can I understand?
Mai bhi muuh mei zabaan rakhtahun Kaash pucho ki muddah kya hai?	I have a tongue to speak, I too aspire. If only she would ask me my desire.
Jab ki tum bin nahi koi maujud, Fir ye hangama, ae Khuda kya hai?	You are One in all entirety; So, then what means this strange variety?
(Mirza Asadullah Ghalib)	(David Matthews)

Following is the translation by Dr. Ambreen Kharbe:

Oh My foolish heart what has happened to you?

At last what is the cure for this pain?

35

I am eager and you indifferent.

Oh my God! What's the matter?

I too have tongue to express.

I wish how my desire would have been asked?

There is none beside her presence;

Then Oh my God why this strange variety?

In the above Gazal, the translation will face linguistic, aesthetic and cultural as there are two languages involved in the form of SL and TL. The background of the translator matters a lot. He should know the culture of both the language and of course a deep knowledge of linguistic aspects of language. Metaphorical meaning too matters. In the second couplet, the use of the word 'woh' is misinterpreted by David Matthews. He has used the word 'she' for 'woh'. It can be general. The poet might have used it for King, any ruler, any person, or maybe a beloved.

3.4 CONCLUSION

Generally, the translator's objective is indistinguishable from that of the writer. He has to make several assumptions about the target language readership, their familiarity with the topic and the culture. It remains a tightrope walk for a translator. As translation is simultaneously a theory and a practice, the translators, besides dealing with the difficulties inherent to the translation of prose, must think about the artistic features of the text, its exquisiteness and approach, as well as its marks (lexical, grammatical, or phonological). They should not forget that the stylistic marks of one language can be immensely different from another. Finally, the translator should produce a coherent version that is reasonably readable, fairly faithful and if possible, a work of art in itself. Such a text can only be produced by a combination of art, craft and creativity.

Translation of poetry is not easy because the differences between a poem and its translation start right from the storage of conception. The cause of a poetic piece is mostly intuitive and spontaneous and the reason for the translation is initiative and advertent. A poet writes about a particular thing or experience because a penetrating perception of something or a situation moves the poet so deeply that he gives a verbal expression to his experience.

Thus, it is the poet's own emotional, imaginative or intellectual apprehension of facts and experiences which a poet tries to express. Hence, there is a vital difference between the activities of original composition, which in the case of original poem, intuition was the cause of conception of the composition, in the case of the translation the cause of conception is the original poem. The original work stimulates the translator to such an extent that he experiences a deep affinity for the work which in turn prompts to create a version of that experience in his own

language. Yet, the most frequent criticism against translation is that it lacks the spontaneity and power of the original work. It is true that no man can think or feel exactly in totality as the other man and this is not what is expected of a translator either. A good translator of poetry has to be a man of imagination who should be able to pursue and interpret a poem and clothe it in the beauty and freshness of creativity once again.

3.5. CHECK YOUR PROGRESS

1) Discuss the linguistic issues in the process of fiction translation. Highlight the cultural problems the translator encounters while translating fiction and prose from SL to TL.

2) Analyze the major issues a translator has to undergo while translating fiction.

3) Explain the major problems in the process of translating fiction and prose. Give suitable examples.

4) Discuss the linguistic and socio-cultural issues in the process of translating fiction. Illustrate with suitable examples.

5) Discuss the linguistic issues in the process of poetry translation.

6) Highlight the aesthetic and cultural problems translator encounters while translating poetry from SL to TL.

7) Analyze the major issues a translator has to undergo while translating poetry.

8) Explain the major problems in the process of translating poetry. Give suitable examples.

9) Discuss the linguistic, aesthetic and socio-cultural issues in the process of translating poetry. Illustrate with suitable examples.

❖ ❖ ❖ ❖

PART-II: TYPES OF TRANSLATION-PROCESS AND PROBLEMS: TRANSLATION OF DRAMA

Unit Structure

4.0 Objectives

4.1 Introduction

4.2 Problems in the translation of Drama

4.3 Illustrations of Translated Dramatic Texts

4.4 Conclusion

4.5 Check Your Progress

4.0 OBJECTIVES

● To acquaint the students with the loss and gain in literary translation and the strategies applied.

● To make the readers aware of the typical issues the translator faces as drama is a performing art.

4.1 INTRODUCTION

As a literary genre, drama is only realized in performance. As a literary form, it is designed for the theatre because characters are assigned roles and they act out their roles as the action is enacted on the stage. Drama is also said to be a theatrical craft. In the domain of literary translation, poetry is the most challenging of all genres. The translator using her / his skill and creativity can apply the strategies to overcome the problems of translation. Ultimately, it is the meaning and also the form of the texts that need to be transferred. Let's discuss the issues one by one.

4.2 PROCESS OF THE TRANSLATING DRAMATIC TEXT

Translating dramatic texts is a risky one as it is a public art that demands scrutiny of its functions. Philip's principal criteria for translating dramatic texts appear to have been

1) Playability

2) The relationship of the play to the established conventions

3) Clarity of interrelationship between characters.

The translator has to be very careful about scenes speech function of the first scene, the introduction of plot liners so on. With theatre translation, the problem of translating literary texts takes on a new dimension of complexity, for the text is only one element in the totality of theatre discourse. The language in which the play text is written for voice, the literary text contains also a set of paralinguistic systems where pitch, nation, speed of delivery, accent etc are all signifiers.

In addition, the play text contains within it the under text or what we call subtext that determines the movement of action. It is not only the context but also the coded gestural patterning within the language itself that contributes to the actors' work, and the translator who ignores all systems outside the purely literary is running into serious risks in the first scene introduction of plot lines and so on with theatre translation, the problem of translating literary texts take on a new dimension of complexity, for the text is only one element in the totality of theatre discourse. The language in which the play text is written for voice, the literary text contains also a set of paralinguistic systems where pitch, nation, speed of delivery, accent, etc. are all signifiers.

Drama is different from other genres of literature. It has unique characteristics that have come about in response to its peculiar nature. It is difficult to separate drama from performance because, during the stage performance of a play, the drama brings life experiences realistically to the audience. It is the most concrete of all genres of literature. The playwright does not tell a story. Instead, one gets the story as the characters interact and live out their own experiences on stage.

The text of a play is but one component of what we generally call drama. The non-verbal part plays a crucial role in the eventual appreciation of a play. How is a play to be translated? As a purely literary text or as a comprehensive work that has verbal and non-verbal components? There are people like Anne Ubersfeld who believe that text and performance cannot be delinked and any translation that looks at text alone is a highly inadequate one. Peter Bogatyrev has pointed out how a character's social situation is brought out not just by the text alone but by extra-textual factors like "the actor's gestures, finished off by his costumes, the scenery, etc" (qt in Bassnett 122). The dramatic text also has undertones that reveal the nature of relationships or the mental state of a character. It is these nuances that tend to slip through the gaps of translation. The good theatre translator cannot afford to ignore these paralinguistic aspects of dramatic performance. It can also not be denied that certain texts like Shakespeare's have been translated as written texts without much attention to the performance aspect. The plays of Bernard Shaw with their long speeches also tempt the translator to focus only on the written part. What is significant about these plays is that they are largely taught as academic texts without their performance component. In terms of translatability, the difficulty level posed by dramatic texts would come second to poetry.

From the perspective of poststructuralist or deconstructionist approaches to translation, any creative work of art, particularly literature, can be

considered to be open, and often subject to multiple or diverse interpretations by the target audience. From this perspective, it can be said that to some extent, such open texts are incomplete as the target audience plays a major role in enriching and completing them (Umberto Eco 1985). However, of all the literary genres, the drama text is an incomplete text par excellence, whose incomplete nature has a significant incidence on its translation.

The mission of a translator of a dramatic work is slightly different from any other literary piece. A dramatic text is written in order to be performed on stage. The translator of such a text has therefore to bear in mind that the readers (i.e., the audience in this case) shall not only follow the written form of the script but also and primarily its spoken version. This fact influences the work of a translator to a great extent. He has to choose words that are easily pronounceable by actors and comprehensible to the audience. At the same time, he ought to aspire to maintain the meaning and form of the original as much as possible so that the translation represents the goal and effort of the original author. Each translator aims at a maximal realistic authenticity, including both the inner (author's and director's notes) and outer language of the drama.

There is a close relationship between the author and the translator of a literary work. Both of them have their style of writing and expressing their thoughts. Nevertheless, the translator shall always be subordinate to the author whose text is considered the base of a dramatic text and its further stage production.

In the development of the art of reproduction two norms have been applied according to Levý (Levý 1963, p.52): the norm of reproduction (i.e., the requirement on authenticity and accurateness) and the norm of "art" (requirement on beauty). This basic aesthetic contrast proves contrapositive to translational authenticity and freedom. The authentic method (i.e., the literal) represents a procedure of work of such translators who aspire to reproduce the original precisely, whereas the free method (adaptative) aims at beauty, i.e., the aesthetics and thought proximity to the reader and creation of original work in a target native language. For a realistic translation, both norms are necessary: the translation has to be an exact reproduction of the original as possible but above all, it should be a valuable literary piece of work.

The translator of a dramatic text has to respect the specialty of a spoken word. Dialogues do not narrate and depict actions or situations as in prose but they form them. They do not narrate how people meet and make relationships but perform the people acting and communicating with each other. The structure of a sentence of dialogue is simple as could be; the sentences are usually practically connected, often without conjunctions. Many unfinished sentences and ellipsis may appear. So-called contact words are very important as well. Various modal particles and expressions that might have multifarious context meanings are characteristic of the language of dialogue. In this case, dictionaries shall not be that useful for the translator for the language of drama is very specific and often peculiar.

Newmark (Newmark 1988, p.172) suggests that a translator of drama in particular must translate into the modern target language if he wants his characters to 'live', bearing in mind that the modern language covers a span of, say, 70 years. If one character speaks in a bookish or old-fashioned way in the original, written 500 years ago, he must speak in an equally bookish and old-fashioned way in the translation, but as he would today, therefore with a corresponding time gap – differences of register, social class, education, temperament, in particular, must be preserved between one character and another. Thus, the dialogue remains dramatic, and though the translator cannot forget the potential spectators, he does not make concessions to them.

Slang represents a specific language field within each language and a specific problem for translators to be solved. It often includes emotional elements and thus characterizes the speaker. According to Knittlová (Knittlová 2000, p.111), the collation of slang words that have various system relations in different languages is very difficult. In slang (especially of young people) we can notice an effort to be outlandish and to exaggerate expressive gestures. Slang wants to shock, and provoke, it is a sign of revolt or disobedience. It is presented via overexposing some categories of expressions, hyperbole, metaphorical phraseology, colloquial metaphors, irony, comicality, folk expressions, and above all playfulness with the language.

The boundary between slang and colloquial English is rather movable and indistinct. Slang is an extract of colloquial language, it is not tied in with the rules of standard English, but it is rated as vivid, colorful, more full-bodied for the diction, and more flexible. It arises from a natural need for the creation of new words that emotionally affect the utterance and express a subjective evaluation of reality. Nevertheless, slang is not a secret code; an English speaker understands it easily but does not consider it something quite correct. Knittlová concludes that it is therefore a distortion of style if a translator replaces the English slang with offensive words or even by vulgarism.

The continual change in the concept of performability is another aspect that the translator of theatre texts faces. It is a well-known fact that since performance is determined by the various developments in acting style, playing space, the role of the audience, the altered concepts of theatre, and the national contexts, the translator has to consider time and space as variables in the changing concept of performance. A central consideration for the theatre translator, therefore, must be the performance text and its relationship to the contemporary audience (Bassnett: 132). The presence of the audience indicates that the function of theatre transcends the strictly linguistic level found in other types of texts and reveals the public dimension of the challenges

a theatre translator faces when attempting to achieve an effect: "The translator must take into account the function of the text as an element for and of performance." (ibid)

In theatre text translation, there are two types of problems. The first type is common in the translation of theatre texts as well as the translation of other types of literary productions. In "Practical Approaches to Translating Theatre", Zatlin lists some of the problems of theatre translation (See Zatlin 2005: 67).

They are -

(1) Investigating copyrights and acquiring permission before deciding to translate a play. In addition to securing the right to translate, it is important to

(2) Identify the appropriate version of the text (ibid.: 67).

(3) The choice of the translated text: Many factors determine the choice of the source text. It is chosen for a certain purpose and the guidelines of translation are defined to serve this purpose by the translator and/or by those who initiate the translating activity. Most translation projects are initiated by an actor of the domestic culture such as state ideology, cultural climate, the expectation of the target audience, economic and social reasons, etc (Aksoy2002: 4-5). Almost always the translated source texts in Iraq are selected by the translators themselves and the main factors in this selection are personal taste and the familiarity of the authors of the source text.

(4) There is another problem that the translator faces; namely, the lack of institutional framework within which the translations are produced (Lefevere:1992:135). The position of translation as a literary activity in Iraq is a case in point. Neither the government nor the Ministry of Culture has a role in channeling the efforts of the translators into an institutionalized project on a national scale.

(5) There is also the problem of cultural differences. As Alan Thomas says, "It is evident that cultural borders, as much as language, form barriers to good translation." (Zatlin.: 9). Pavis similarly observes: "We cannot simply translate a text linguistically; rather we confront and communicate heterogeneous cultures and situations of enunciation that are separated in space and time (ibid.). Moreover, Eugene Nida believes that "differences between cultures may cause more severe complications for the translator than do differences in language structure."(In Kate James 2000: 2).

Bassnett points out, the written text is a functional component in the total process that comprises theatre and is characterized in ways that distinguish it from a written text designed to be read in its own right. She stresses the theatrical aspect of drama and argues:

"A theatre text, written with a view to its performance, contains distinguishable structural features that make it performable, beyond the stage directions themselves. Consequently, the task of the translator must be to determine what those structures are and to translate them into the

target language, even though this may lead to major shifts on the linguistic and stylistic planes (In Bassnett,122- 123)."

This is why a detailed structural analysis is necessary for the translation process. If a translator has a better understanding of the structure, many problems can be avoided from the beginning. It is noteworthy that various parts of the play text vary concerning their translatability. For instance, in most cases, stage directions as a part of the play text do not cause special problems in the process of translation. Stage directions are the playwright's descriptions or commentaries (Burkhanov: 408) explicating the setting or dramatic personae's emotional states and peculiarities of behaviour. There are also stage directions indicating "stage business," i.e., physical actions or movements performed by a character, intended to establish an appropriate atmosphere, reveal his or her state of mind or explain a situation. Burkhanov believes that it is "the instances of dramatic speech forming the verbal exchanges between the characters that need the translator's ultimate attention and effort."

Unlike the conversational style in the other literary types, the dialogue in the theatre text is special. The characteristics of this theatrical dialogue such as rhythm, intonation, patterns, pitch and loudness may not be immediately apparent from the straightforward reading of the written text in isolation. Robert Corrigan, in a rare article on translating for actors, argues that at all times, the translator must hear the voice that speaks and take into account the 'gesture' of the language, the cadenced rhythm, and pauses that occur when the written text is spoken (Bassnett: 122). In line with this, Pavis (2005: 219) believes that the words spoken by the actor (or any other kind of stage utterance) must be "analyzed in the way they are concretely stated on stage, colored by the voice of the actor, and the interpretation of the scene, and not in the way we would analyze them if we had read the written text."

The nature of the relationship between the written text and its audience is another problem the translators of theatre texts face. In this regard, Ortrun Zuber succinctly observes, "a play is dependent on the immediacy of its impact on the audience." (qt. in Zatlin: 1) Unlike the readers of the translated novels, spectators in the theatre must grasp immediately the sense of the dialogue. In this respect, Clifford Landers correctly states: "Even style, which is by no means unimportant in dramatic translation, sometimes must yield to the reality that actors have to be able to deliver the lines convincingly and naturally" (ibid.).

Susan Bassnett distinguishes five types of drama translation strategies:

1) Treating the theatre text as a literary work.

2) Using the SL cultural context as a frame text.

3) Translating 'performability'.

4) Creating SL verse drama in alternative forms.

5) Cooperative translation. (Bassnett 1985:90)

In the translation of texts that are categorized as literary, the loss of some literary features or some shift from the source may be natural but the translated version may contain some unique features that result from the translator's attempts to retain or recreate the literary effects of the original. Cook's comment on the translation of literary texts seems to be relevant here:

Literariness will reside at times in the unique linguistic choice, and at times in the fictional world. Thus, in practice, some literary features are lost in translation; others survive through well-chosen equivalents; others are unique to the translation; others are in the story itself. (Cook 1994: 98)

Shakespeare's plays written nearly four centuries ago have linguistic and cultural features, some of which might have disappeared long ago. Yet numerous adaptations and rewritings of Shakespeare's plays in Assamese since 1888 indicate that some kind of familiarity of experiences, feelings and emotions expressed through the content, and to be sure, a little strangeness of the atmosphere, as well as the content, might have been appealing to the new readers from an entirely different culture. In the following, we will look at several types of such "interventions" in the original ST to accommodate the new readers.

A modern translator of a Shakespeare play needs to be aware of several problems that arise in translating (not adapting or domesticating as most early translators did) a literary text produced in an alien culture. In such a text contextual clues may not be readily available to the average non-native reader, certain expressions in the text may evoke what is implicit and what the native speaker intuitively knows. As T. R. S. Sharma notes, "A context not fully internalized in the text, but that surrounds the text and is often suggested by a keyword or an image, this semiotics of culture that envelops the text, is often lost in translation" (Sharma 2004: 150). For example, in the following extract from Hamlet the word nothing can be easily replaced by an appropriate functional-linguistic equivalent such as eko nai, eko nahoi in the TL, Assamese, but the problem arises from the ambiguity created by the not-so-explicitly stated context of the word.

Ophelia: What is, my Lord? (Hamlet 3.2.115)

Hamlet: No thing.

No equivalent can bring out the connotations of the English word no thing (the thing was commonly used to refer to the sexual organ of either a man or a woman) in this context. So, some kind of explanatory note needs to be added, foregrounding, not obliterating, the foreignness and cultural distance.

Although the differences between the structures of the source and target language do not automatically lead to poor translations, they present many difficulties for the translator. One problematic language pair is English and Finnish as their structures are quite different. Pennanen (1967, p. 168) argues that Shakespeare's Finnish translator faces serious problems, especially with verse, since the structures of the English and Finnish

languages differ radically; in fact, they are opposites. The morphology and syntactic structure, and also the word formation of English are analytical, whereas Finnish is synthetic in its structure; its words are long, usually much longer than the English words. Moreover, in English, the typical meter is the iambic one, whereas in Finnish the emphasis is on the first syllable which makes the trochee, that is, a downward meter, natural for the Finnish language. It could be said that the Finnish translator faces insuperable difficulties, but the practice has proved this assumption wrong as numerous translations of high quality are made from English into Finnish.

One aspect of drama must be taken into account in every drama and theatre translation: how the translation works on stage. Déprats (2004a) emphasizes that the translation needs to follow the rhythm of the breath to work on stage. He quotes a French Shakespearean actor, Jean Vilard, who says that translators cannot find the rhythm which characterizes good plays and that translations do not "breathe" so that the actor could be carried along on the breath of the text (p. 137). Déprats reminds us that Shakespeare's plays are above all written for the stage and for the actors who utter the lines. Therefore, the theatrical dimension of the play, that is, its vocal energy, must be preserved when translating for the stage. In my opinion, this can also be applied when the translation is not aimed at the stage only; the theatrical dimension must be preserved in all translations whether for a specific theatre production or a book; otherwise, the translation does not fulfill its function of representing a play, or it has a different function (e.g., modifying the play to a tale).

Translation of plays involves a peculiar problem. While prose fiction could be considered as a 'fully round unit', a play could be read-only as 'something incomplete' because the full potential of the text is realized only in performance. In other words, the text of the play and its performance are inseparable. Jiri Veltrusky in his book ***Drama as Literature*** explains this relationship:

The relationship between the dialogue and the extra-linguistic situation is intense and reciprocal. The situation often provides dialogue with its subject matter. Moreover, whatever the subject matter may be, the situation variously interferes with the dialogue, affects the way it unfolds, brings about shifts or reversals, and sometimes interrupts it together. In its turn, the dialogue progressively illuminates the situation and often modifies or even transforms it. The actual sense of the individual units of meaning depends as much on the extra-linguistic situation as on the linguistic context. (Veltrusky, 10).

In the Becket play ***Waiting for Godot,*** for instance, much of the dialogue depends on the situation of endless waiting. Besides the situation, there is also other extra-linguistic item like rhythm, intonation, pitch and loudness which affect the dialogue and the meaning of the text of the play. The relationship between these items and the dialogue of a play may not be visible when one views the text in isolation. To grasp the relationship, the translator, as Robert Corrigan argues "must hear the voice that speaks and

take into account the 'gesture' of the language, the cadence, rhythm and pauses that occur when the written text is spoken" (McGuire,112). Peter Bogatyrev in his article "Fewer Signs du Theatre" even lists down the costumes of the characters as well as the scenery as extra-linguistic signs that affect the meaning. Besides these, the complexity of the text is increased by the changing concepts of performance and acting styles as well.

The task of the translator, considering this special complexity added to the text of the play by the extra-linguistic items of such a wide variety, becomes a difficult one. To translate a dramatic text possible, the translator must identify and take into consideration the extra items. Also, because of these items, the translator must be prepared to make major shifts in the linguistic and stylistic planes. However, if the text is translated for a reading public, then literalness and linguistic fidelity could be the principal criteria of the translation. Otherwise, the linguistic element must be translated bearing in mind its function in theatre discourse as a whole.

4.3 ILLUSTRATIONS OF TRANSLATED DRAMATIC TEXTS

Let us take a review of Brecht's *Caucasian Chalk Circle* and its Marathi adaptation by Late C T Khanolkar as *Ajab Nyaya Vartulacha*. Gruscha in Caucacian Chalk Circle is called Hamsie galh in Khanolkar's Marathi version. When Gruscha takes the child of the Governor, she undergoes a long march to reach the village of her brother – Hamsie in Khanolkar's Marathi version reaches her brother's house after a long march. The wife of her brother asks her >Whose child are you carrying with you? If it were yours, where is your Mangalsutra? < By making her sister-in-law ask her about the mangalsutra, the plot is transferred into the milieu of Maharashtra by Khanolkar. The dramatist, doing translation, is in search of equivalence.

To make the recipient of the target language accept the experience through the work, the translator has to take care to make the experience in the work sound it to be his own. For this, a lot of recontextualization has to be done by the translator.

Further, let's have a look at Vijay Tendulkar's plays originally written in Marathi. **Ghashiram Kotwal** has been translated into several Indian and European languages; Hindi, Kannada and Bengali are among the Indian languages and Indian and German are among the European languages. When the play was performed in Delhi production by Abhiyan in Hindi, according to Tendulkar the play had a different impact; it had less entertainment value, less music and greater impact as a serious play. Thus, any performance that drops music, truncates the impact almost completely. The music, the dialogue and the voice culture used in the Marathi play are in a way inseparable because they communicate quite a lot at the sub-cultural level to keep on adding instantaneously layers of meanings, innuendoes and culture-specific additives that enrich the

magical experience in the theatre. Music is inseparable from the structure of the play, the form of the play as it is conceived. The play is not a serious play but a play that keeps on commenting on the power dynamics and the way they operate by presenting what goes on happening at the surface level in a way that is very entertaining and this is in keeping with the Marathi folk tradition. The bathos, the ludicrous in the situation is brought to the fore as much as the cruelty in it, the first act accentuating the first and the second act bringing out the second aspect.

Language and songs cannot be ignored. There are a lot of verbal ironies which are difficult to maintain in the other language. The additional feature is the voice of 'Nana' (the character of the play). Mohan Agashe who played the role of 'Nana' made use of two different voices. One for the public performances and one for the domestic and erotic exchanges. The later one was the nasal voice commonly found among the Chitpavan Brahmins of those times, adding a localized edge to the depiction of the character. Much of this would be lost, as the English translation has omitted these songs completely.

If there was a loss in subtleties the nuances in the performances in the translated version from the other Indian languages would certainly be multiplied in the English translation. In performance-oriented play, the problem is critical. The form of the play itself thus demands the dramaturgical capacity to work in several dimensions at once, incorporating visual, gestural, aural and linguistic signifiers into the text.

4.4 CONCLUSION

For a 'stage' translation to attract the public and pull a large audience and guarantee its success, it must have an appeal, such that after watching the play the audience can say it was a beautiful play. Consequently, rather than describing or characterizing page and stage translations as aesthetic and commercial respectively, it could be more elucidating for the drama translation scholar to regard both types as endowed with aesthetic qualities but differing in the rewriting or recreation strategies used by the translator to meet different (though sometimes incompatible) objectives.

4.5 CHECK YOUR PROGRESS

- Comment on the performability or speakability problems faced by the translator while translating drama.

- Why is the structural analysis of drama necessary? What are the problems faced by a translator in this process?

- Highlight the issues related to linguistic and cultural features in the act of drama translation.

- How is the translation of dramatic work slightly different from other literary pieces? Illustrate.

- Examine the hindrance that occurred due to dialogues/spoken words, music and songs faced by a translator in the process of translating a dramatic text.

- What are the major problems in Theatre Text Translation?

- Discuss the problems a translator faces in translating a dramatic text in an alien culture.

❖ ❖ ❖ ❖

<div align="right">

5

</div>

TRANSLATED LITERARY TEXTS: PART-I: PREMCHAND'S SHORT STORY "*GULLI-DANDA*" TRANSLATED FROM HINDI INTO ENGLISH

Unit Structure

5.0 OBJECTIVES

- To make the reader aware of the concept of translation through the prescribed short story- *Gulli-danda* by Premchand

- To make a comparative analysis of the text at the thematic and linguistic level

- To analyze the degree of faithfulness achieved in the process of translation

- To analyze gain and loss in the act of translation regarding the short story, *Gulli-danda.*

5.1 INTRODUCTION

The translation is not like mathematics once you know the formula, you can do it. Yet it is a science. However more than science, it is a skill, craft and above all an art. Hence students in this unit are expected to know and study the practical problems the translators come across and how they overcome them. Translation, being a game of loss and gain, the students will realize that with a little loss, much is gained. Therefore, should study and compare the given text with its translation examining the loss and gain of meaning thereby exploring the beauty of this art.

5.2 INTRODUCTION OF ORIGINAL WRITER AND TEXT

Dhanpat Rai Srivastava, better known by his pen name Premchand; was born on 31st July 1880 and was an Indian writer famous for his modern Hindustani Literature. A pioneer of Hindi and Urdu social fiction as he was, he also was one of the first authors to write about caste hierarchies and the plights of women and labourers prevalent in the society of the late 1880s. He is one of the most celebrated writers of the Indian subcontinent and is regarded as one of the foremost Hindi writers of the early twentieth century.

His first novella, *Asrar-e-Ma'abid* was first published in *Awaz-e-Khalq*, an Urdu Weekly, after which he became associated with an Urdu magazine *Zamana,* writing columns on national and international events. The writer is mainly recognized for his creations that always contained a social message and raised a voice against the social evils pertaining to Indian society. His creations brought the era of realism to Indian literature at a time when only fantasy fiction and religious writings were dominating it. Premchand embodied the social purpose and social criticism in his characters that are subjected to different circumstances and act accordingly. He wrote at a period when Gandhiji was not only leading a decisive battle against the British Raj but also working on the removal of untouchability and communal politics perpetrated by the Hindu Mahasabha as well as the Muslim League. His works include *Godaan, Karmabhoomi, Gaban, Mansarovar, and Idgah*. His first collection of five short stories was published in 1907 in a book called *Soz-e-Watan.*

Hindi literature was never as open to caste and gender inequalities as Premchand enriched it through his writings. Premchand's influence on Indian literature cannot be overstated. As the late scholar, David Rubin wrote in *The World of Premchand* (1969), "To Premchand belongs the distinction of creating the genre of the serious short story—and the serious novel as well—in both Hindi and Urdu. Virtually single-handed he lifted fiction in these languages from a quagmire of aimless romantic chronicles to a high level of realistic narrative comparable to European fiction of the time; and in both languages, he has, in addition, remained an unsurpassed master."

Premchand loved books and was a voracious reader so it is no surprise that he took to writing. His first novel appeared in 1901 and his first short story in 1907. He continued to write for the rest of his producing 300 short stories, dozens of novels, several essays, articles, editorials, screenplays, plays and translations in a relatively short span of 36 years. In the world of his stories, love for humanity is the greatest religion. The most authentic and penetrating of Premchand's portrayals centers around village life. Most of the characters are poverty-stricken. Thus, Premchand always was a man of people and his soil. The values that shine through the finest of his writings are values of love, compassion and tolerance

Published in *Sarasvati* in 1925, *Gulli-Danda* is a short story revolving around a man who returns to his village after many years and tries to re-live his childhood days by playing Gulli-danda with his childhood companions. But due to social and economic disparity among them, he is treated differently and a fair match is not possible. This short story was later translated by Anupa Lal.

The students are expected to compare the texts of गुल्ली-डंडा (in Hindi by Premchand) and *Gulli-Danda* (translated in English by Anupa Lal) and to analyze the different aspects of the process of translation.

Summary of *Gulli Danda*:

Two friends from childhood times used to play Gilli Danda together. One of them is an engineer and a top government officer now and twenty years later visits the same village where the other one "Gayaa chamaar" is a servant of another government official.

When the engineer returns to the same village where he spent his early time, he feels the smell of the sand, the voices of Gulli-danda team, and the trashy village, everything seems to have lost its charm. He only knew one person, Gaya, the champion of their team. He meets him once and plays one game, then back to the village. However, being grown up, he fails to get a sense of friendship and the spontaneity of the game. The respect and honor in the mind of Gaya for the officer came in between. In the game with the officer, the champion seems to have lost the hold on the game but with others, he displays his championship in the tournament. It highlights socio-economic differences as well as childhood innocence which is beyond any such discrepancies in the social system.

5.3 INTRODUCTION OF TRANSLATOR AND TRANSLATED TEXT

Anupa Lal has been writing for children since 1970. She has published over 20 books including an early re-telling of *Ramayan*. She has translated many stories by Premchand and his famous novel, *Godaan* in English. The English translation of Gulli-danda takes the reader into the lives of rural folk of India. She selected fourteen stories from "*Mansarovar*", a collection of short stories Premchand and published its translation in two volumes. The story "Gulli Danda" appears in Volume II. Gulli Danda contrasts the carefree spirit of childhood with the self-consciousness and awareness of material status that creeps later into one's life. There is a strong autobiographical element running through this story. Anupa Lal's translation is ideal for Indian children who have English as a second language. It is published by Ratna Sagar Publication. The selected story "*Gulli-danda*" by Premchand is set in rural India.

5.4 COMMENTS ON DEGREE OF FAITHFULNESS

Literary translation has to do with translating texts written in a literary language, which abounds in ambiguities, homonyms and arbitrariness, as

distinct from the language of science or that of administration. Literary language is highly connotative and subjective because each literary author is lexically and stylistically idiosyncratic and through his power of imagination, he uses certain literary techniques such as figures of speech, proverbs and homonyms through which he weaves literary forms.

The literary translator is therefore a person who concerns himself with the translation of literary texts. A literary translator, according to Peter Newmark (1988:1) generally respects good writing by taking into account the language, structures, and content, whatever the nature of the text. The literary translator participates in the author's creative activity and then recreates structures and signs by adapting the target language text to the source language text as closely as intelligibility allows. He needs to assess not only the literary quality of the text but also its acceptability to the target reader, and this should be done by having a deep knowledge of the cultural and literary history of both the Source and the Target Languages.

Fidelity in translation is the passing of the message from one language into another by producing the same effect in the other language, (in sense and form), in a way that the reader of the translation would react exactly as the reader of the original text. The relationship of fidelity between the original and its translation has always preoccupied translators, but the problem is, as far as translation is concerned, one should decide to whom, and to what the supposed fidelity pertains. Is it fidelity to the proto-text, to the source culture, to the model of the reader, or the receiving culture? Is it possible to have the same translation of the same text done by different translators? And/or to what extent can a translator be accurate or exact in his translation? The majority of translators agree that translators should be adequately familiar with both the Source and the Target Language, but there is less agreement on 'faithful' translation and how linguistics should be employed.

The eminent critic in Translation Studies, Eugene Nida gives two types of translation: Formal and Dynamic. The dynamic translation is meant for literary texts. All great works of literature are translated following the principle of Dynamic equivalence resulting in faithful as well as beautiful translations. However, Anupa Lal's translation seems to be unfaithful to the original seeking lot of liberty.

Dryden has classified translation into three categories: Translation, Adoption and Adaptation. The present translation, I think, falls in the second category: Adoption. Looking at it from an adoption point of view, it is a very good adoption and Anupa Lal is successful in adopting Premchand's Gulli-Danda in Hindi into English. Hence it is not a translation of the story. Probably, she tried to simplify it so that it becomes comprehensible to children who study English as a second language. It seems, her goal of translation is building vocabulary and acquainting the learners with the structural pattern of the second language. As a result, her translation has lost the message that the story has to give. Because the story subtly highlights how the innocence and joy of childhood are killed as the person reaches adulthood. The ideas of status, post, money and

prestige that are absent in childhood take a front seat in adult life. These things construct a wall between any two personalities while forming a loving, long-term relationship. Hence, although the narrator has all the joys of life, he misses the joy of friendship and innocence. He cannot relate to Gaya not only because of caste distinction but also because of economic class.

5.5 COMMENTS ON GAIN AND LOSS IN THE ACT OF TRANSLATION

Along with the concept of equivalence is the notion of loss and gain in translation. Implicit in most translation theories is the assumption that something is lost when you carry a text from one language into another. There is always the possibility of miscommunication in the act of communication that is translation; if the receiver goes slightly askew in the decoding, the chances are that the message will not be carried across correctly. Certain elements can be added or left out. Robert Frost's famous definition of poetry is notable: "Poetry is what gets lost in translation". The basis of Frost's statement is the concept of the creative originality of the poet who creates a work where the meaning lurks somewhere beneath the surface of words. The translator, it is assumed, cannot ever hope to capture the 'meaning' of the original SL which tends to fall through the gaps of the TL. Overenthusiastic translators can also inadvertently pad up the text by adding more to it than is necessary with the result that the translation might have more allusions in it than was originally thought of.

The problem of loss and gain is again due to the cultural dissimilarity between two linguistic groups. Something very common in a particular community might be rare in another. It is said that the language of the Eskimos has more than one hundred words to describe 'snow'. These subtle distinctions they make between various types of snow cannot be brought out in a single Hindi word. The reverse is also applicable. For instance, the word '*godhuli*' in Hindi cannot be translated with the help of a single English word. It needs to be explained as the 'hour at which the cattle return home causing the dust to rise by their hooves'. There is of course the word 'dusk' but that becomes only an approximation; what is lost here is the suggestion of Indian village life where dusk is the holy time when cattle return home and lamps are lit. Here there is a loss in translation.

This is one of the major challenges facing a translator who is translating a literary work. Literary language, besides being informative and factual, is also allusive and elliptical. The translator has to be vigilant to these resonances in the SL text and attempt.

Anupa Lal's translation of *Gulli-danda* is meant for children. Since the target readers in the mind of the translator are the one who is learning English as a second language, the selection of the structure and vocabulary has an advantage and limitations too. The first sentence **"I consider Gulli Danda, the king of all sports!"** is the translation of "हमारे अँग्रेजी दोस्त

मानें या नमानें मैं तो यही कहूँगा कि गुल्ली–डंडा सब खेलों का राजा है। He begins the story with "I consider" while the verb in the source text is, "कहूँगा", and translated as "considered". The original Hindi sentence ends with a full stop while translated one ends with an exclamatory mark. The number of paragraphs in the target text is too many compared to the source text. The word "thapi" in the fifth line is completely absent when the author lists various instruments such as lawn, court, net etc.

Roman Jacobson points out the innermost difficulty on every level of translation such as linguistic, cultural etc. Since any translation is an operation in both languages (SL and TL). The problems on the linguistic level are enormous as SL and TL, English and Hindi belong to two different linguistic families. In the present story, being in Hindi, the words, phrases, and references are indigenous and some are untranslatable. The phrases and idioms such as हमजोलियों, अमीरानाचो चलों are either missing or lost in translation.

Even when Gaya is addressing the speaker, he uses the term "सरकार" which is kept as it is in the translated text. The word 'Sarkar' is a term used in an Indian scenario to address someone holding a higher authority of some sort. The translator has kept the word as it is to portray the tone of respect that is evident in the original text.

The short story is set in pre-independent India. The setting is not native to the target language. The process of finding an equivalent for a particular term that's deeply rooted in culture or is exclusive to only a certain community in a language that's not native is not always possible. As mentioned prior, the term 'गुल्ली-डंडा' can be considered as an example. Also, terms like 'गाली' are translated as 'curse' in the translated version, which is a swear word.

Even in the case of the structure of sentences in TL, Anupa Lal has taken complete liberty, e.g., the division of paragraphs is plenty, but the syntax of the sentence and morphology and phonology etc are not taken care of. The dialogues and punctuation marks of SLT are different from TLT. In short, linguistically it is not, a faithful translation at all.

Language is deeply rooted in culture. The Indian culture of SL and the English culture of TL are completely different. As a result, it is a challenge to translate culturally loaded terms. To find the exact equivalence and to transfer the perfect sense of "chamar" that will transfer the sense of untouchability and the caste system of India together, is next to impossible. To facilitate, the translator borrows the terms from the English game of cricket such as batting, fielding etc and supported it with pictures in the story so although the translator is successful in communicating the sense, she has failed to give a faithful translation.

Translation of the title:

Anupa Lal doesn't translate the title of the story and just transliterates it. There is hardly any formal or dynamic equivalence to this very sense, the

native game of India. The narrator is very fond of this game and hence tries to prove its superiority by comparing it with English games. As the game of cricket has been transliterated into the Indian language, the translator has left the title, "Gulli danda" without translation.

5.6 CONCLUSION

It is an accepted fact that the translator faces problems when he or she translates culture-specific terms, or terms related to dialects. It is not incorrect to say that the translator is accomplishing a complicated task of recreating a replica of the original work, where he or she is trying to use words like pieces of a jigsaw puzzle to bring to life a picture as seen by the author himself. There are no set parameters to judge a translation, but when it comes to literary translation, as stated above, the process may look like an attempt to make a replica of an original piece, the translator makes all effort to do justice to the text, but we cannot deny the fact that a masterpiece remains a masterpiece.

The cultural elements are the heart and soul of any original text; they blow a breath of life into any piece of writing. So, the translator has to accomplish the mammoth task of translating also thrive with life like the original text, by translating the cultural elements, which in a real sense carry the true essence of any literary work. Incorrect translation of these elements leads the reader to perceive a different image of the original work.

Evaluating the present translation, one can say that there is hardly any gain if it is examined by applying parameters of various critical theories. However, if it is evaluated from an adoption point of view, it is a big success. It is so because, in adoption, only the sense has to be transferred ignoring the linguistic and cultural elements. Various linguistic levels such as phonology, morphology, semantics, syntactic etc cannot be checked. Thus, in the end, one can say that it is a very good adoption but a failed translation.

5.7 CHECK YOUR PROGREE

1) Analyze the degree of faithfulness between the original and translated text of Premchand's "*Gulli-Danda*"

2) Compare and contrast SLT and TLT at the level of thematic and linguistic aspects in the story of "*Gulli-Danda*"

3) Examine the gain and loss achieved in the process of translation of "*Gulli-*".

4) Compare and contrast SLT and TLT at the level of thematic and linguistic aspects applying to the text prescribed for you.

5) Compare the various aspects between the original text and the translated text of the story "*Gulli-Danda*".

6) Critically evaluate the loss and gain in the short story "*Gulli-Danda*" by Premchand translated by Anupa Lal.

7) Assess how far the translator Anupa Lal is successful in doing justice to the source text while translating Premchand's "*Gulli-Danda*".

5.8 BIBLIOGRAPHY

1. Premchand's Selected Stories 1, Translated and adapted by Anupa Lal, Ratna Sagar, P. Ltd. New Delhi 1995.

2. https://archive.org/stream/in.ernet.dli.2015.185016/2015.185016.The-World-Of-Premchand_djvu.txt

❖ ❖ ❖ ❖

TRANSLATED LITERARY TEXTS: PART-II: NISSIM EZEKIEL'S POEM "NIGHT OF THE SCORPION" TRANSLATED FROM ENGLISH INTO MARATHI (ADHUNIK STOTRA BY PRADEEP DESHPANDE)

Unit Structure

6.0 OBJECTIVES

● To acquaint the students to a translation of a literary text from English to Marathi.

● To enable the students to understand the nuances of translation of a poem

● To illustrate how a literary text is translated from one language to another

● To enable the students to analyse different aspects of translation in the prescribed translated poem

6.1 INTRODUCTION

Nissim Ezekiel, a poet well-known for his realistic sensibility and subtle expressions, has contributed to the history of Indian English poetry especially to the foundational years of post-colonial Indian literature. His poem 'Night of the Scorpion' has been translated and is included in the collection of his translated poems in Marathi by Pradeep Deshpande. The translated version is included as a part of this paper with a view to introduce to the students how a literary text is translated from one

language into another. It is very interesting to analyse whether the linguistic and cultural aspects of translation as a process have impacted the equivalence between the original and the translated versions of the poem. It is also important to know whether the translator has found it easier to transfer the essence of the original poem in English into the Marathi version due to the cultural resemblance.

6.2 ABOUT THEPOEM AND THE POET

The original poem 'Night of the Scorpion' in English, while depicting the horrifying scenario in the darkness of night in an Indian village, presents the poet's observations on the superstitious approach of the villages in a simple narrative yet candid manner. The poet, a Jewish Indian, narrates the incident from a house in rural India in present tense. A small incident like sting of a scorpion and the resultant pain and suffering, in an Indian peasant's life represents a host of religious, cultural, traditional aspects of Indian life. Superstitions and beliefs were and possibly still are an integral part of the village life in India which is highlighted throughout the free-flowing verse. A detached yet curious observer with an eye for minute detail, the poet has described the scene with a rare sensibility and insight towards the way social lives of Indians are influenced by superstitions.

The poem is so powerful in its technique of description, choice of diction and the manner of presentation that the reader can visualize the incident right in front of his/ her eyes. The context and the incident are quite ordinary- a very common experience in rural India- sting by a scorpion and the suffering caused. The poet's mother is stung by the scorpion which is treated and reacted to in two opposite ways by two different kinds of temperaments. One of these is that of the neighbouring peasants who have carried certain beliefs as transferred to them by previous generations and impulsively begin to follow those beliefs in order to treat the poet's mother. Each of their moves is described by the poet in minute details in such a manner that the reader is presented with his deep sense of observation and analysis of human behaviour.

The poem has been looked upon by many as a critique of the way superstitions influence the lives of Indian peasants. However, it is necessary to look at the poet's approach as a silent observer who instead of being judgemental is able to compare the traditional beliefs and the scientific approach of his father.

"My father, sceptic, rationalist,

trying every curse and blessing,

powder, mixture, herb and hybrid.

He even poured a little paraffin

upon the bitten toe and put a match to it."

There is no rhyme scheme followed in the regular sense of the term

throughout the eight stanzas of the poem. The fifth and the sixth stanzas where the poet has employed the device of *anaphora,* a repeated refrain successfully evoke a soporific impact among the readers through the prayer-like in cantation.

"May he sit still, they said

May the sins of your previous birth

be burned away tonight, they said.

May your suffering decrease

the misfortunes of your next birth, they said.

May the sum of all evil

balanced in this unreal world

against the sum of good

become diminished by your pain.

May the poison purify your flesh"

The poem presents the incident as a first-person narrative in free verse. Multiple figures of speech like alliteration, antithesis, hyperbole, simile and metaphor as well as personification enrich the text. Interestingly, the poet has used the simile of 'swarms' for the villagers in the neighbourhood as he describes the incident of stinging by scorpion.

Apart from presenting the fact of superstition as an integral part of rural India, the poem also highlights Indians' belief in the philosophy of Karma. This is reflected when the peasants believe that the poet's mother was stung by scorpion because of her sins in the past birth. The philosophy of Karma entails a belief that when a person is rewarded or punished, it is the result of sins committed by him/ her in the past.

The belief that sufferings bring about purification is also highlighted as the neighbours say that the poet's mother can attain purity from her bodily desires and material ambitions thus bringing her soul close to the divinity.

The poem proves to be thought provoking for the reader as the simple, innocent world of peasants in rural India highly influenced by superstitions and the super natural is juxtaposed very realistically with the intellectual world of rational and scientific temperament in the form of the boy's father. Though the reader may somewhat be made to look at the description of the peasants' behaviour as critical, the conclusion reveals the beautiful aspect of the reality- in the world of superstition, full of pain and suffering, the motherly affection of the woman remains intact as she says,

'Thank God the scorpion picked on me and spared my children.'

As known for being genuinely Indian, Ezekiel has made this poem a typical piece of Indian English literature in its theme, style and presentation.

Nissim Ezekiel (1924-2004), according to Keki Daruwalla, was the first Indian poet to express modern India's sensibility in a modern idiom. He is

also known to be the father of modern Indian poetry. A Jewish Indian, he wrote poems like *The Unfinished Man* (1960)which, in the initial days of his career, were full of images of 'city' which are characteristic of modern Indian poetry. (Hussain and Zaidi:2016). However, his poetry is equally rich with the images from Indian landscape and culture. As pointed out by Hussain and Zaidi, he has successfully expressed his Indianness through his writing as Indian values, customs, philosophy, language, spirituality and Indianness is 'in his blood'.

He is known for his experimentation with the idioms and the language of Indians. (Hussain and Zaidi:2016). *A Time to Change* (1952), *The Exact Name* (1965), *Hymns in Darkness*(1976) are some of the published anthologies of Nissim Ezekiel. Apart from alienation, love, marriage, exile from himself are some of the prevalent themes in his poetry. Unlike other Indian poets who mostly are bilingual poets, Ezekiel has written only in English.

Beginning his career in journalism as an assistant editor of The Illustrated Weekly of India in1953, he also worked as an advertising copywriter and the general manager of a picture frame company. He was the art critic with *The Times of India* and also edited *The Poetry India*(1966-67). Ezekiel won the Sahitya Akademi Award in 1983 and was awarded Padma Shri in 1988 for his contribution to Indian English writing.

Ezekiel is known for his experimental use of Indian idioms and language in poetry. He is known for an eye for minute details, ironical and humorous presentation and yet sympathetic approach towards humanity. As rightly mentioned by Hussain and Zaidi, though irony is a favourite mode in his poetry, it is not bitter and pungent but gentle and soothing. His poetry is Indian in true sense as it draws its thematic and contextual material from Indian history, traditions, beliefs and myths. His subtle observations on human life in India enrich his poetry with a simple description of situations in the lives of Indians. As mentions Kashikar, Ezekiel plays a genuine commitment to the craft, authenticity of articulation and sincerity of purpose.

Jewish by birth, he has considered India to be his own land. "India is simply my environment. A man can do something for and in environment by being fully what he is. By not withdrawing from it. I have not withdrawn from India." (Twentieth Century Indian Poets: R. Parthasarathy: 1999 cited in Kashikar). A man with a rare sensibility deeply rooted in the land where he was brought up, he reveals a genuine humanistic approach throughout all the poems. Every poem, thus, crafted with great care yet simplistic, rich in imagery concludes on a humanistic note. The rootedness of his poetic approach can be explicit in the following lines from his own poem *Enterprise*:

'Our deeds were neither great nor rare home is where, we have together grace.'

Night of the Scorpion too is deeply rooted in the Indian soil, culture, philosophy and beliefs. As mentioned earlier, the poem reflects Ezekiel's

humanistic approach towards the whole scene of the boy's mother's suffering after getting stung by the scorpion and the typical rural Indian way to treat her.

6.3 ABOUT THE TRANSLATOR

This very Indian poem in English by Nissim Ezekiel has been translated into Marathi by Pradeep Deshpande as a part of the translation of his anthology *Latter-Day Psalms* into Marathi entitled 'आधुविकस्तोत्रिं 'published by Sahitya Akademi. The translated version of the poem is 'वविंचवाचीरात्र'.

Prof. Pradeep Deshpande who retired as the Head, Dept of English from S.B. Science College, Aurangabad has remained a prolific translator who has more than 350 translations of poems to his credit. Apart from poetry, he has also translated stories from English to Marathi and has critical articles to his credit in the field of translation and comparative literature.

'आधुविक स्तोत्रिं 'was the first publication by Sahitya Akademi that was honoured by Sahitya Akademi as the best translation in 1995 as the juries found it apt to break from their convention of not awarding the publications by Sahitya Akademi.

He began his journey in the field of translation in 1974. He translated the poems of Kazi Salim from Urdu into Marathi which was prescribed as a text in the syllabus of Comparative Literature at University of Pune. Deshpande has tried hands at translations from different languages to Marathi as well as from Marathi to English. He co-edited आजचे विश्व साहित्य: एक ओळख with Dr. Sudhakar Marathe and Ravindra Kimbavne which was specifically commissioned by British Council and was published by Oxford University Press. It was an attempt to acquaint the Marathi readership to the contemporary British literature in Marathi.

He has translated 11 poems by American poet Wallace Stevens in Marathi as well as has to his credit, Marathi translations of two well-known poems of T.S. Eliot, namely, *Preludes* and *Rhapsody on a Windy Night*. The translations were included in a special edition of *Lokmat*, a Marathi daily, on the occasion of Eliot's birthday. He has also translated English poems by Ted Hughes, David Gaskoi and the Czech poet Vitezslav Nezval into Marathi.

Praadeep Deshpande has an important contribution to an anthology of Medieval Indian Literature edited by Ayyappa Panicker and published by Sahitya Akademi in the form of his translations of the poetry by legendary saint poets in Marathi, Namdev, Dnyaneshwar, Ramdas, Shridhar, Moropant, Sawata Mali, Janabai, Muktabai and Chokha Mela.

His translations of modern Marathi poets like Narayan Surve, Keshav Meshram, Bhalchandra Nemade, Narayan Kulkarni Kavathekar, Manohar Oak and Rajni Parulekar have been published in *Indian Literature* published by Sahitya Akademi. In a different issue of the same journal, he has also translated Hindi poems by Chandrakant Devtale. Poetry in Urdu by Kazi Salim, Akhtar-ul-Iman, Sayyed Arif and Balraj Komal has been translated by him into Marathi.

Apart from this venturing into the realm of poetry, he has also translated the stories by Sham Manohar, a Marathi author, into English which was published in *Indian Literature*. He has also penned articles like **Myth in the Novels of Vilas Sarang and Bhalchandra Nemade**(2003).

With this vast experience in the practice of translation to his credit, he has been invited as are source person in Translation Studies at refresher courses organized by the Academic Staff Colleges of various universities in Maharashtra like that of Mumbai, Pune, Nagpur and Jalgaon.

Interestingly, his insightful treatment of the original poetry and a careful and mature approach towards original and target language as well as towards process of translation is clarified very well in the preface to his translated version of *Latter-Day Psalms* in Marathi. He mentions that the poems *The Patriot* and *Irani Restaurant Instructions* could not and should not be translated into any regional Indian language according to him. This is because, as Deshpande mentions, the unintentional humour created by the errors in spoken English by Indians is the thematic characteristic of these two poems. He says that the English language spoken in the Indian metropolis has distanced itself away from its grammar and purity. He points out that English is used in India is for the purpose of communication and as a false status symbol. In short, it is used as a need in India by maximum. Ezekiel's wit and sense of humour has caught the anomalies in such use of English full of errors and presented it beautifully in English through these two poems. According to Deshpande, then, getting those poems back again into the regional Indian language would be meaningless and would lack the charm completely as the commentary and humour expressed naturally in English cannot match the canvas of regional language.

He further mentions the need to understand the basic relation of the language and terminology used in the poems by Ezekiel with the Biblical concepts. One cannot interpret those words in English in denotative sense as used in the prevalent usage but it is necessary to understand the Biblical connotations of those words which, a she specifically mentions, he has followed. This introduction to his role as a translator helps the reader in interpreting the translated version with a sense of comparative analysis of the original language and the target language. Deshpande also mentions in the preface that he has taken great care to be faithful to the original version.

6.4 SUMMARY OF THE POEM

The poem Night of the Scorpion begins with a memory, a reflection by the speaker (the poet presents the whole scene in the first-person narrative). It is the description of this memory of the night when his mother was stung by a scorpion. The context is rural Indian house in the rainy days. To escape from the heavy rain outside, the scorpion had sought shelter below the sack of rice in the speaker's house and biting his mother, it again slipped out in the rain. The evil nature of the scorpion and its sting is suggested by the word 'diabolic' tail and the word 'streak' used to

describe its speed. As the narrative begins, there is no scorpion seen as it had already escaped.

The neighbouring peasants who come to the house are described as 'swarms of flies' and their concern for the boy' smother is reflected in the way they start applying their conventional, superstitious beliefs to treat her. As they are compared to the swarms of flies, their enchantments to the God are looked upon as buzzing. According to their belief, their reciting the name of God hundred times would paralyze the evil in the poisonous scorpion.

A belief among rural Indians that the movement of the scorpion makes the toxin move in the blood of the victim of the sting is narrated here. To stop the movement of the scorpion, thus, in order to reduce the spread of toxin in mother's body, they keep hunting for the scorpion with lanterns and candles on the 'mud baked walls'. But they can't locate it. Different ways are tried to help soothing the pain and agony of his mother but none seems to work.

They also keep chanting some hymns that create a soporific effect. They express a wish for the scorpion to be still somewhere and also that the sting should prove to be a purifier thus burning all the sins committed by his mother in her previous birth. They also pray for the agony to reduce the probable misfortunes she is supposed to face in her next birth. According to them, this sting should lead to the purification of her worldly desires.

This narration of their superstitious treatment is followed by the mention of the speaker's father who is a sceptic and rationalist and a non-believer. He tries different scientific ways to treat his wife like different herbs, mixtures, paraffin, etc. The speaker then watches the holy man who performs his holy rites to 'tame the poison with an incantation' which is in vain.

The sting, finally, loses its toxic impact after twenty hours and the mother is relieved of the agony. While expressing her gratitude to God for helping her out of this poisonous experience, it is not for herself that she thanks the God but the relief for her is that her children were saved of the sting and instead she was attacked. The poem thus concludes on an emotional note displaying the unconditional love of a mother, a universal truth that a mother always has her children and their wellbeing in her thoughts.

Apart from dealing with rational and irrational, superstitious and scientific approach, the poem displays concern, care and love. The thread of humanity runs in every individual, be it the rational father or the superstitious peasants or even the mother who perhaps, being a peasant woman, is not so educated.

6.5 ABOUT THE TRANSLATION OF 'NIGHT OF THE SCORPION'

The original poem in English is translated in Marathi as 'विंचवाचीरात्र' by Pradeep Deshpande. Though the medium is English, the context of the

poem is specifically Indian. Rural India wherein the people do neither use English in their daily conversation nor can many of them read or even understand the language. Nissim Ezekiel still has been successful in helping the reader visualize the whole scene narrated in the poem. The simple, vivid description in English (though a foreign tongue for the land) as well as the thematic richness and the content make it typically an Indian poem. The translated version in Marathi has successfully transferred the content as well as the theme of the original English poem.

Considering the form, the translator has remained sincere to the concept of equivalence. The free verse metrical pattern of the original poem has effectively been kept intact by the translator in Marathi.

"I remember the night my mother

"मला आठवते माझ्या आईला व विंचू चावला होता"

Was stung by as scorpion. Ten hours

ती रात्र दहा तासाच्या सततधार पावसामुळं

of steady rain had driven him

सरपटत यावं लागलं होतं त्याला

to crawl beneath a sack of rice."

तांदळाच्या पोत्याखाली"

Generally, there is a risk for the translator to lose the semantic richness while concentrating upon the form and the syntax of the original to be intact in the translated version. But he has successfully performed this difficult task of transferring meaning to the TL. The meticulously crafted work displays his rich sense of interpretation and of responsibility as a translator to convey the meaning of the original through the TL.

In order to convey the exact meaning of some words in English, he uses very specific Marathi words which adequately shows his expert command on the TL as well as deep understanding of the language of the original text. For example, to convey the unbearable, horrifying nature of the pain caused by the scorpion's sting, he translated 'flash of diabolic tail' as 'आसुरी नांगीतल्या विषाचा लोळ'. The words' आसुरी' for diabolic and 'लोळ' for flash transfer the very essence of its meaning. The translator's familiarity with the context, theme and his command over the TL have certainly proved to transfer the meaning skillfully.

The neighbours are compared to the swarms of flies by Ezekiel. The translator has skillfully transferred the simile without making any changes even in the metrical pattern.

The' mud baked walls' in Ezekiel's poem become 'उन्हात रापलेल्या भींती' in the Marathi version thus expressing the simplicity of the village life and the close affinity to the nature. The mud used for walls doesn't need to be dried or baked but the bright sunshine does the job. The mud is not only dried but even gets the tanned look thus symbolizing the life of a peasant.

Considering the context, the translation of the poem comes as a fine piece of literary craft successfully transferring the semantic, syntactic, thematic and contextual essence of the original poem. The last part of the poem, the mother's gratitude to God for saving her children from getting stung proves the universality of motherhood and the motherly love.

6.6 CHECK YOUR PROGRESS

1. Discuss how the original poem **Night of the Scorpion** has successfully been translated in Marathi bringing alive the semantic, metrical and contextual essence of the original into the TL.

2. Write a note on the treatment of original poem in English in its translation into Marathi.

6.7 BIBLIOGRAPHY

●   https://smartenglishnotes.com/2020/12/17/night-of-the-scorpion-by-nissim-ezekiel-summary-paraphrase-analysis-and-questions/#Theme_of_the_poem

●   https://genius.com/Nissim-ezekiel-night-of-the-scorpion-annotated

●   Hussain, Z. and Zaidi, R. **Socio-cultural Ethos and Indianness in the Poetry of Nissim Ezekiel: An Overview.** *American International Journal of Research in Humanities, Arts and Social Sciences.*(2016).https://www.academia.edu/36929796/Socio_cultural_Ethos_and_Indianness_in_the_Poetry_of_Nissim_Ezekiel_An_Overvi ewAccessedon 22[nd]November,2022.

●   Kashikar, Y. **Indianness in the Poetry of Nissim Ezekiel.**https://www.academia.edu/11008464/_INDIANNESS_IN_TH E_POETRY_OF_NISSIM_EZEKIEL_Accessed on 22[nd]November, 2022.

●   Khanna, M. **Critical Tenets of Nissim Ezekiel's Poetry: A Perspective.** *International Journal of English Language, Literature and Humanities.* Vol. III, Issue VII.

●   (2015).https://www.academia.edu/37758720/Critical_Tenets_of_Nissi m_Ezekiels_Poetry_A_PerspectiveAccessed on 22[nd]November, 2022.

●   Special acknowledgement to the translator, Pradeep Deshpande, who made the text of the translated version available on request and also was kind to share his thoughts in a telephonic conversation regarding the process of translation, the problems faced by him while translating Ezekiel's poetry.

❖ ❖ ❖ ❖